



Funded by
the European Union



PARLIAMENTARY OVERSIGHT IN THE PARLIAMENT OF 10th CONVOCATION OF GEORGIA

PART TWO



**Funded by
the European Union**



PARLIAMENTARY OVERSIGHT IN THE PARLIAMENT OF 10TH CONVOCATION OF GEORGIA

PART TWO

**Tbilisi
2025**

This publication has been produced with the assistance of the European Union. Its contents are the sole responsibility of Georgian Young Lawyers' Association and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union.

Publication supervisor: NANUKA KRUASHVILI

Head of Publication: SALOME SAGHARADZE

Author: GIORGI ALAVERDASHVILI

Publication Assistant: NINO MATCHARASHVILI

Editor: KHATUNA KVIRALASHVILI

Technical Editor: IRAKLI SVANIDZE

It is prohibited to reprint, reproduce or distribute the materials of this publication for commercial purposes without prior written permission of Georgian Young Lawyers Association.

J. Kakhidze street №15, Tbilisi, Georgia
(+995 32) 295 23 53, 293 61 01
www.gyla.ge

© 2025, Georgian Young Lawyers Association

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	5
1.1. Research Goals, Reporting Period and Subjects	5
1.2. Type of Research	5
1.3. Methods of Research	5
1.4. Used Sources	5
II. RESEARCH FINDINGS	6
III. GENERAL OVERVIEW OF THE WORK OF PARLIAMENT IN 2023-24	8
IV. PARLIAMENTARY OVERSIGHT ON PLENARY SESSION	10
4.1. Annual Report of the Prime Minister	10
4.2. Ministerial Hour	11
4.3. Summoning of Accountable Officials to the Plenary Session	22
4.4. Interpellation	23
4.5. Temporary Commission	32
4.6. Temporary Commission of Inquiry	32
V. THE QUESTION OF THE MEMBER OF THE PARLIAMENT	34
VI. COMMITTEE CONTROL MECHANISMS	35
6.1. Obligation to Provide Information	35
6.2. Summoning of Officials to Committee Sitting	35
6.3. The Thematic Rapporteur of the Committee	37
6.4. Thematic Inquiry	40
6.5. Establishment, Composition and Term of Authority of the Working Group	45
6.6. Studying the Work of Administrative Bodies	47
6.7. Entities of Parliamentary Oversight over the Security Sector	48
VII. RECOMMENDATIONS	54
ANNEXES	56

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

U.S. – The United States of America

OTA - The Operative-Technical Agency

GYLA – Georgian Young Lawyers' Association

SSPS – The Special State Protection Service

LEPL – Legal Entity of Public Law

SSS - The State Security Service

MIA – The Ministry of Internal Affairs

I. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

1.1. Research Goals, Reporting Period and Subjects

The Georgian Young Lawyers' Association monitored the parliamentary sessions of the 2021 Fall Sessions and the 2022 Spring and Fall Sessions of the Parliament of the 10th Convocation in the first part of the Research.¹ The present research is the second part of the monitoring of the oversight function of the 10th Convocation Parliament and covers the reporting period of the 2023-24 Spring and Fall Sessions.

This document mainly covers general mechanisms of parliamentary oversight, which are employed at the committee, as well as at plenary levels. In addition, the research specifically focuses on mechanisms designed for security sector oversight. As a result, the reader will not only learn about the steps the Parliament has taken to address flaws in legislation, but also about the recommendations that have been disregarded without any consideration. The research identifies ways to solve deficiencies.

1.2. Type of Research

The group of researchers, while working on the document, employed doctrinal research methods, which are based on legislation, as a primary source. Moreover, the research involved the use of some secondary sources, such as articles, books, reports, studies of various organizations, minutes and shorthand reports of plenary sessions, and data provided by Legislative Branch. With the use of primary and secondary sources, the Parliamentary Oversight law in Georgia is analysed, and relevant problems within it are identified.

1.3. Methods of Research

During the development of the current document, the following research methods were used: analytical, descriptive, normative, comparative and historical. Considering these methods, the existing mechanisms of the Parliamentary Oversight will be analysed, which will reveal their strengths and weaknesses. Based on the findings of the research, it will be possible to improve the legislation.

1.4. Used Sources

The following sources have been used while working on the report:

- The legislation of Georgia;
- Parliamentary reports, minutes and shorthand reports of committee sittings and plenary sessions, which have been obtained from the Parliament through requests for public information, as well as publicly available minutes of the sessions, audio-video recordings and so on;
- Documents prepared by international organizations;
- Analytical data of Parliamentary Oversight mechanisms on the security sector.

¹ Alaverdashvili G., Kapanadze N., Parliamentary Oversight in the Parliament of 10th Convocation of Georgia: Part One, Georgian Young Lawyers' Association, 2023.

II. RESEARCH FINDINGS

The present chapter combines the main findings identified during the research process, *inter alia*, it reveals the problems and main tendencies with regards to the Parliamentary Oversight.

Generally, it can be said that in 2023 and 2024, the Parliamentary Oversight in the Parliament of the 10th Convocation faced various difficulties, partly due to the ongoing political crisis in the country and the incomplete and inadequate use of the mechanisms defined by the Rules of Procedure by the Parliament. Within the framework of oversight mechanisms, there were frequent violations of procedures, delays motivated by political reasons, and evasion of responsibility by accountable individuals. At the same time, against the backdrop of the opposition boycott, there was a noticeable lack of thematic diversity in discussions and partial formality of debates, which generally weakened the effectiveness of the oversight process. As a result, parliamentary oversight largely became a formal process and paid little attention to the critical needs of society.

More particularly, the main findings are, as follows:

The Report of the Prime Minister

The Report of the Prime Minister did not include a full review of the past year, as he had been appointed to the position a few months before the report was presented.

Ministerial Hour

Various issues have emerged within the procedural framework of the Ministerial Hour. Scheduled reports in the election year were not held regularly. During the Ministerial Hour, the majority of the MPs were absent from the hall. In case of the opposition, this was due to their protest against ongoing developments in the country, which is extensively covered in the research. Often, the Minister is given more time than originally planned, which, in some cases, is used to discuss other matters. Despite this, the content of the reports is sometimes overly general and does not specifically address the activities of the past year. Moreover, the majority of MPs are more likely to focus on criticizing the opposition than asking questions, which detracts from the thematic focus of the discussions.

Summoning Officials to the Plenary and Committee Sessions

Within the 10th Convocation, The MPs did not apply to the mechanism to summon accountable officials to the Plenary Session. Moreover, the mechanism for summoning officials to committee sessions was practically not used, which was due to the high quorum requirements set by the Rules of Procedure and the passivity of the majority. In 2023-2024, no committee summoned the Prime Minister, the Prosecutor General, or other high-ranking officials, and opposition initiatives in this regard mostly remained without results.

Written Question of the MP

Written questions sent by the opposition, in most cases, were left unanswered by the addressees.

Interpellation

During the interpellation procedure, speakers are often given more time than what is specified by the Rules of Procedure. Furthermore, a single interpellation often addresses sub-

stantially different issues, which reduces the effectiveness of the discussion, while the given time is sometimes insufficient. Interpellation was postponed several times, and in some cases, Ministers were not present for the interpellation, citing attendance at other events as the reason.

Temporary Commission of Inquiry

It is noteworthy that the majority artificially creates obstacles to the establishment of temporary commissions of inquiry. As a result, no temporary commission was created in 2023 and 2024, and, in fact, no such commission was established throughout the 10th Convocation Parliament.

Committee Action Plan and Thematic Rapporteur

The Action Plans of the Committees do not equally allocate thematic reports among the Committee Members. It is noteworthy that if a member leaves the committee or Parliament, their responsibilities are left unaddressed because the action plan is not updated. Often, Thematic Rapporteurs do not give reports on the issues assigned to them at all. In some cases, the identity of the Thematic Rapporteur is not specified by name.

Oversight over Defence and Security Sector

During the reporting period, there were personnel changes in the Committee. Specifically, the Committee Chairperson was appointed by the Prime Minister as the head of the Intelligence Service, which raises legitimate questions about the effectiveness of oversight by his former colleagues, especially given the circumstances in which the findings of the GYLA's Parliamentary Oversight researches confirm the weakness of oversight in this area. It is noteworthy that within the Committee, a number of oversight mechanisms were not used, thematic groups of inquiry were not established, no officials were summoned by the Committee, no working groups were created, etc. In this context, the weakness of oversight is further exacerbated by the work of the Trust Group, which has failed to utilize the opposition's quota.

III. GENERAL OVERVIEW OF THE WORK OF PARLIAMENT IN 2023-24

In February 2023, the so-called “Russian Law”² was initiated in the Parliament by the political group “People’s Power”.³ This sparked the massive wave of protests.⁴ As a result of the protests, on 9 March the ruling party decided to withdraw it and the draft law was rejected during the Plenary Session on 10 March.⁵ In order to receive the Candidate Status for the country, the President of Georgia chose to meet with the European leaders on this matter.⁶ The ruling party decided to initiate impeachment proceedings against the President, as, according to them, the President’s foreign visits were conducted without the Government’s consent.⁷ On 11 September, 80 MPs initiated impeachment against the President, and the Procedural Issues and Rules Committee confirmed the authenticity of the MPs’ signatures on the same day.⁸ While on 12 September, the Constitutional Submission of the MPs was presented to the Constitutional Court.⁹ Eventually, on 16 October, the Constitutional Court within its Conclusion found the violation of the Constitution by the President.¹⁰ Three Judges reached dissenting opinion on this matter.¹¹ In the end, the required 100 votes to impeach the President were not collected in the Parliament.¹² The opposition declared a boycott to the impeachment.¹³ Despite these political developments, the European Union granted Georgia a candidate status at the end of the year.¹⁴

On 25 March 2024, the “Georgian Dream” leaders announced the initiation of the anti-LGBT constitutional amendments.¹⁵ On 4 April, the package of constitutional amendments was

² The Georgian Dream will Re-try to Adopt the Russian Law, TV Formula, available at: <https://formulanews.ge/News/108610>, updated: 04.12.2024.

³ What will make 2023 Memorable in Georgia, Radio Tavisupleba, available at: <https://www.radiotavisupleba.ge/a/32753738.html>, updated: 04.12.2024.

⁴ How did we defeat the “Russian Law”? Civil.ge, available at: <https://civil.ge/archives/586354>, updated: 04.12.2024.

⁵ The Georgian Dream will Re-try to Adopt the Russian Law, TV Formula, available at: <https://formulanews.ge/News/108610>, updated: 04.12.2024.

⁶ Salome Zourabichvili met with the President of Lithuania, TV Formula, available at: <https://formulanews.ge/News/98230>, updated: 04.12.2024.

⁷ The “Georgian Dream” Initiates Impeachment Procedure of Salome Zourabichvili, Radio Tavisupleba, available at: <https://www.radiotavisupleba.ge/a/32573987.html>, updated: 04.12.2024.

⁸ 80 MPs Apply to the Constitutional Court against the President, Radio Tavisupleba, available at: <https://www.radiotavisupleba.ge/a/32587424.html>, updated: 04.12.2024.

⁹ The Constitutional Submission regarding the Impeachment of the President was presented to the Constitutional Court, Radio Tavisupleba, available at: <https://www.radiotavisupleba.ge/a/32588972.html>, updated: 04.12.24.

¹⁰ Constitutional submission of the members of the Parliament of Georgia (Irakli Kobakhidze, Shalva Papuashvili, Mamuka Mdinardze and others (80 members)) on the issue of violation of the Constitution of Georgia by the President of Georgia, the Constitutional Court of Georgia, available at: <https://constcourt.ge/ka/judicial-acts?legal=15923>, updated: 04.12.2024.

¹¹ The Dissenting Opinion of the Members of the Constitutional Court of Georgia - Irine Imerlishvili, Giorgi Kverenchkhiladze and Teimuraz Tughushi Regarding the Conclusion №3/1/1797 dated October 16, 2023, of the Constitutional Court of Georgia, the Constitutional Court of Georgia, available at: <https://constcourt.ge/ka/judicial-acts?legal=15924>, updated: 04.12.2024.

¹² The impeachment of the President failed in Parliament, Netgazeti, available at: <https://netgazeti.ge/life/692900/>, updated: 04.12.2024.

¹³ *ibid.*

¹⁴ The Road to the Candidacy and what will the Status bring? Radio Tavisupleba, available at: <https://tinyurl.com/mssmun43>, updated: 04.12.2024.

¹⁵ GD Pushes for Anti-LGBT Constitutional Law, Civil.ge, available at: <https://civil.ge/archives/588748>, updated: 04.12.2024.

initiated,¹⁶ which restricts a number of rights for LGBT individuals.¹⁷ Since the “Georgian Dream” did not have a constitutional majority in Parliament, they opted to adopting a law with similar content.¹⁸ In the end, the extensive legislative package was adopted by the Parliament on 17 September.¹⁹ Parallel to these processes, the “Georgian Dream” re-initiated the so-called Russian Law on 3 April 2024.²⁰ This was followed by severe reactions from the U.S. Department of State.²¹ The reintroduction of the Law sparked large-scale protests not only in Tbilisi but also in other cities across Georgia.²² Subsequently, on 14 May the Parliament adopted the Law in its third reading.²³ It is noteworthy that the opposition did not support this Law.²⁴ On 18 May, the President vetoed the Law and returned it to the Parliament; the veto was overridden on 28 May by the legislative branch.²⁵

During the 2024 Spring Session, the Chairperson of the Defence and Security Committee resigned from his membership in Parliament after being appointed as the head of Intelligence Service.²⁶ Whilst, the Trust Group in the Parliament of 10th Convocation was composed with an incomplete membership.²⁷

¹⁶ The “Georgian Dream” initiated a legislative package related to the constitutional amendments “on the Protection of Family Values and Minors, 1tv.ge, available at: <https://1tv.ge/news/ojakhur-ghirebulebebisa-da-arasrulwlovanta-dacvis-shesakheb-sakonstitucio-cvllilebebtan-dakavshirebit-qartulma-ocnebam-kanonebis-paketi-daainicira/>, updated: 04.12.2024.

¹⁷ The Draft Laws are available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/365605?>, <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/365603?>, updated: 04.12.2024.

¹⁸ Odikadze N., The Long-term Observation Mission of the 2024 Parliamentary Elections – I Interim Report, April-June, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2024, 16.

¹⁹ The Law on “the Protection of Family Values and Minors” and related legislative package, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/#law-drafting/28703>, updated: 04.12.2024.

²⁰ The Georgian Dream will Re-try to Adopt the Russian Law, TV Formula, available at: <https://formulanews.ge/News/108610>, updated: 04.12.2024.

²¹ The U.S. Department of State on the Russian Law: It undermines Georgia’s commitment to Euro-Atlantic integration, TV Formula, available at: <https://formulanews.ge/News/108794>, updated: 05.12.2024.

²² Odikadze N., The Long-term Observation Mission of the 2024 Parliamentary Elections – I Interim Report, April-June, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2024, 9.

²³ Foreign Agents’ Law Adopted, Amid Protests, Brawls, Civil.ge, available at: <https://civil.ge/archives/606294>, updated: 05.12.2024.

²⁴ Vote Report regarding the first reading adoption of the Draft Law, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/360506?>, Vote Report regarding the second reading adoption of the Draft Law, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/361379?>, Vote Report regarding the third reading adoption of the Draft Law, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/361669?>, updated: 05.12.2024.

²⁵ Odikadze N., The Long-term Observation Mission of the 2024 Parliamentary Elections – I Interim Report, April-June, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2024, 13-14.

²⁶ Irakli Beraia to Head the Georgian Intelligence Service, Civil.ge, available at: <https://civil.ge/ka/archives/590441>, updated: 05.12.2024.

²⁷ Alaverdashvili G., The Historical and Organizational Overview of the Trust Group, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2024, 12.

IV. PARLIAMENTARY OVERSIGHT ON PLENARY SESSION

4.1. Annual Report of the Prime Minister

The 2023 Report

The Prime Minister of Georgia shall submit an annual report on the implementation of the Government Programme to Parliament.²⁸ The Head of the Government appeared before the Parliament on 30 June 2023.²⁹ His address lasted for about 1 hour and 35 minutes. Overall, the Prime Minister dedicated a significant part of his speech to criticizing the opposition (about one third of the entire speech).

After the report, 48 MPs asked questions, 22 of whom represented the majority, while 26 – the opposition.

Instead of answering the clarifying questions, the Prime Minister gave only a brief concluding statement.

It is also noteworthy that the speech of the Prime Minister did not practically focus on more or less problematic issues. Furthermore, the vast majority of the “Georgian Dream” MPs asked questions that either allowed the Prime Minister to showcase himself or provided grounds for criticizing the opposition.

It is recommended that both the Prime Minister and the MPs direct their speeches towards the topics outlined in the Government Programme, while current issues can be discussed within the framework of other oversight mechanisms.

The 2024 Report

On 8 February 2024, 84 Members of the Parliament passed a vote of confidence in the Government of Irakli Kobakhidze.³⁰ Prime Minister Kobakhidze presented his first report to the Parliament on 28 June 2024.³¹

The Prime Minister submitted his written report³² until June 1, particularly, on 31 May,³³ and appeared before the Parliament in the last month of the Spring Plenary Sessions, in June. 81 MPs attended the Prime Minister’s speech. The speech lasted for approximately 1 hour and 23 minutes.

Irakli Kobakhidze stated that he would discuss the past 4-5 months within the framework of the report. In this case, he spoke about a period less than a year. GYLA has repeatedly emphasized that, to avoid such issues, **it is essential for the Prime Minister’s annual report**

²⁸ The Constitution of Georgia, Article 55(5).

²⁹ The Official YouTube Page of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://youtu.be/SX3GKYLYW8?si=PasFuR6SIXiyolFo>, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RyZl4Jm5v4g>, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=0hCYLNFQM-o>, updated: 21.10.2023.

³⁰ According to Kobakhidze, his first visit as Prime Minister will be to Brussels, Radio Tavisupleba, available at: <https://www.radiotavisupleba.ge/a/32811269.html>, updated: 13.07.2024.

³¹ The Report of the Prime Minister on the Progress of the Implementation of the Government Programme - 28.06.2024, YouTube Page of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_HbyLTIU8Zk, updated: 13.07.2024.

³² The Report on the Progress of the Implementation of the Government Programme, June 2023 – May 2024, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/zedamxedveloba/premieri-2024/2023-2024.pdf>, updated: 13.07.2024.

³³ The Letter of the Prime Minister of Georgia to the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/365446?>, updated: 13.07.2024.

to coincide with the anniversary of the motion of confidence.³⁴

After the speech, the procedure continued in a Q&A format. A total of 16 members of Parliament asked questions, including: 6 from “Georgian Dream”, 4 – “People’s Power”, 3 – “European Socialists”, 2 – “Girchi”, 1 – “Reforms Group”.

The Prime Minister answered nearly all questions. However, when responding to a question from an opposition representative, he mentioned that since the MP was not present in the hall, it was possible that he would not answer the question. The absence of the MP from the hall does not, of course, exempt the speaker from answering the questions.

Subsequently, the questions directed to the Prime Minister were mainly thematic, but due to the ongoing events in the country, a large portion of the opposition did not attend the speech, resulting in a lack of critical questions.³⁵

It is important that the speaker answers all questions, regardless of whether the MP is present in the hall during the Q&A phase. Additionally, the opposition should use this platform to ensure the Prime Minister’s accountability before the Parliament.

4.2. Ministerial Hour

In 2023, all twelve Ministers were heard, of which 5 presented reports during the Spring Sessions, and 8 - during the Fall Session. During the 2024 Spring Session, 6 Ministers presented reports before the Parliament. In addition, during this session, the Minister of Foreign Affairs requested the change in the date,³⁶ which was approved by the Bureau.³⁷ Despite this, the Minister of Foreign Affairs did not appear before the Parliament on the new date either. The hour of the Minister of Defence was also postponed from the Spring Session to the Fall Session.³⁸ The reasons for requesting the change of date had not been explained,³⁹ however, the Bureau approved this request as well.⁴⁰ The Minister of Justice also requested a date adjustment for the Fall Session.⁴¹ The Parliament Bureau did not discuss this issue. In addition, in the year of parliamentary, presidential or municipal body elections, the plenary sittings of the Parliament shall not normally be held for a period of 1 month before the elections.⁴² Therefore, in practice, the Parliament did not convene in a Session Format in October. In September, no minister appeared before the Parliament.⁴³ As a result, the Tenth Convocation Parliament did not hear reports from some members of the government for 2024. This, in turn, does not allow for proper oversight by the legislative body, especially given the

³⁴ Alaverdashvili G., Kapanadze N., *Parliamentary Oversight in the Parliament of 10th Convocation of Georgia: Part One*, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2023, 17.

³⁵ It refers to the protests amidst the adoption of the so-called Russian Law. For further information regarding this, please, see, Chapter III of the present Research.

³⁶ The Letter NGOV 2 24 00006004 of the Government of Georgia to the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/357027?>, updated: 10.12.2024.

³⁷ The Decision N326/22 of the Bureau of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/357334?>, updated: 10.12.2024.

³⁸ The Decision N361/17 of the Bureau of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/364104?>, updated: 10.12.2024.

³⁹ The Letter NGOV 1 24 00016174 of the Administration of the Government of Georgia to the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/363993?>, updated: 10.12.2024.

⁴⁰ The Decision N361/17 of the Bureau of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/364104?>, updated: 10.12.2024.

⁴¹ The Letter of 2 September 2024 of the Minister of Justice, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/368102?>, updated: 10.12.2024.

⁴² The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 88(5).

⁴³ The Sequence of Ministers Who Appeared before the Parliament during the Ministerial Hour, available at: <https://parliament.ge/supervision/minister-hours>, updated: 10.12.2024.

fact that a parliamentary model of government is established in the country. Following the 2024 Parliamentary Elections, the so-called Parliament granted vote of confidence to the so-called Government.⁴⁴ Hence, a comprehensive oversight of Government work could not be carried out during the previous Convocation. This serves as a poor practice. **It is essential that in an election year, the implementation of oversight mechanisms is planned in such a way that the assessment of the activities of all accountable Ministers is possible before the elections.**

The 2023 Spring Session

The Hour of the Minister of Internal Affairs

The Minister of Internal Affairs of Georgia, Vakhtang Gomelaury, appeared before the Parliament on 21 February 2023.⁴⁵ The exact number of MPs present during the Ministerial Hour is unknown, but at the beginning of the day, 90 MPs registered. Representatives of the “United National Movement” did not attend the session due to a boycott.

The address of the Minister lasted for 35 minutes. At the beginning of his speech, the Minister emphasized the importance of maintaining peace and stability in the country through the efforts of the Government. In the context of the activities carried out over the past year, the Minister mentioned the “Government Plan”, which most likely referred to the Government Programme.⁴⁶ The Minister presented statistical data on crime. He, also, addressed the issues related to the modernization of material and technical database and salary increase for employees. Gomelaury also spoke about the reform of the criminal police, the fight against organized crime, including the unprecedentedly large number of drug dealers arrested. The speaker touched on the introduction of the law enforcement officer institution in Rustavi after Tbilisi, border control, and other issues. The Minister’s speech largely referenced the priorities outlined in the Government Programme.⁴⁷

Questions were asked by 16 MPs, of whom 5 represented the majority and 11 the opposition. Overall, the vast majority of the questions were thematic. The procedure largely corresponded to the content outlined for the Ministerial Hour procedure.

The Hour of the Minister of Finance

The Minister of Finance of Georgia, Lasha Khutsishvili, appeared before the Parliament on 23 March 2023.⁴⁸ The 90 MPs registered. The address of the Minister lasted for about 45 minutes. The Minister began by discussing the financial parameters of 2022 and presented the economic growth indicators. He spoke about inflation, import and export figures. He also addressed the data related to state debt in the post-pandemic period, the reform of state-owned enterprises, steps taken in accordance with the Association Agreement, issues related to the regulation of the gambling business, the enforcement of international sanctions imposed on Russia, and other matters.

⁴⁴ Parliament Granting Vote of Confidence to Government of Georgia, available at: <https://parliament.ge/en/media/news/sakartvelos-parlamentma-mtavrobis-akhal-shemadgenlobas-ndoba-gamoutskhada>, updated: 10.12.2024.

⁴⁵ The Official Facebook Page of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/1038745340416868>, <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/3467690666889033>, updated: 22.10.2023.

⁴⁶ Based on the Minister’s speech, we can assume that the reporting period referred to the year 2022 (calendar year).

⁴⁷ The Government Programme 2021 – 2024 Toward “Building a European State”, available at: https://www.gov.ge/files/68_78117_645287_govprogramme2021-2024.pdf, updated: 22.10.2023.

⁴⁸ The Official YouTube Page of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mJAADNW8678>, updated: 22.10.2023.

Following the presentation of the report, the MPs made speeches. A total of 8 of them asked questions, 3 of whom represented the ruling party, while the remaining 5 were from the opposition. Overall, the questions asked by the MPs, as well as the Minister's answers, were thematic. No substantial flaws were observed in the procedure.

The Hour of the Minister of Environmental Protection and Agriculture

The Minister of Environmental Protection and Agriculture of Georgia, Otar Shamugia, appeared before the Parliament on 20 April 2023.⁴⁹ The 125 MPs registered. However, during the procedure itself, the number of MPs decreased, and during the Minister's response, their number further decreased. The address of the Minister lasted for 40 minutes. **It is crucial for the MPs to actively employ this oversight mechanism.**

The Minister spoke about the growing trend of the export of Georgian agri-food products, the functioning of Government assistance programmes, and co-financing issues. He also touched on the priority of the European Union market, the expansion of modern fruit gardens in the country, as well as the creation of a registry for seed and nursery agricultures. According to him, one of the main documents for the Ministry is "Vision 2030" – Development Strategy of Georgia, developed under the initiative of the Prime Minister.⁵⁰ Overall, the address of the Minister covered the priorities prescribed in the Government Programme.

Following the speech, the questions were asked by 30 MPs, 14 of whom represented the ruling party, while 16 - the opposition. No questions were asked which were not thematic. The process took place in a professional atmosphere.

The Hour of the Minister of Internally Displaced Persons from the Occupied Territories, Labour, Health and Social Affairs

The Minister of Internally Displaced Persons from the Occupied Territories, Labour, Health and Social Affairs of Georgia, Zurab Azarashvili, appeared before the Parliament on 18 May 2023.⁵¹ About 15 minutes prior to the Ministerial Hour procedure (before the vote), 125 MPs registered. Fewer attended the Session, and even fewer were present during the questions.

The address of the Minister lasted for 58 minutes. He began his report by listing the reforms the Ministry launched in 2022. The Minister talked about the funding and results of the Universal Healthcare Programme. He also addressed the issue of combating prescription drug addiction. He discussed pension payments, the regulation of overtime pay, the allocation of housing to displaced families, and other issues.

Following the presentation of the report, the MPs made speeches. A total of 26 of them asked questions, 11 of whom represented the ruling party, while 15 - the opposition. The procedure took place in a professional atmosphere.

⁴⁹ The Official YouTube Page of the Parliament of Georgia, available at:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LhVtBsV0tlU>,

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Kt65ldXkCRI>, updated: 22.10.2023.

⁵⁰ This document is similar to the Government Programme, however, it is more extensive and covers 10 years.

⁵¹ The Official YouTube Page of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-3zqk1BqDsw&t=1s> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hPbYDymZYHY&t=45s>, updated: 28.10.2023.

The Hour of the Minister of Foreign Affairs

The Minister of Foreign Affairs of Georgia, Ilia Darchiashvili, appeared before the Parliament on 16 June 2023.⁵² About 15 minutes prior to the Ministerial Hour procedure, 121 MPs registered. The address of the Minister lasted for about 38 minutes. The Minister outlined the process of the European Integration. He also addressed high-level international visits. The Minister highlighted international projects where Georgia is represented in a transit or other capacity. He also spoke about the strategic partnership agreements executed with various countries.

Following the address of the Minister, 36 MPs asked questions, 16 of whom represented the majority, and 20 - the opposition. It is noteworthy that the MPs of the ruling party often used their mandate not to ask questions but to criticize their opponents. The Minister answered the questions briefly, and at the same time, cursorily.

The purpose of the Ministerial Hour procedure is to hear the Report on the implementation of the Government Programme. Therefore, the Minister is obligated to provide the Parliament with information on the topics they are questioned about in this format, not cursorily, but in depth, with maximum detail.

The 2023 Fall Session

The Hour of the Minister of Culture, Sports, and Youth

The Minister of Culture, Sports, and Youth of Georgia, Tea Tsulukiani, appeared before the Parliament on 20 September 2023.⁵³

The address of the Minister lasted for 2 hours and 52 minutes, during which a technical break was for 6 minutes.⁵⁴ The Minister requested an additional 30-minutes to respond to current developments. The 86 MPs registered. During the session, the Minister's address closely followed the written report she had previously submitted.

The content of the address of the Minister mainly corresponded to the Government Programme,⁵⁵ however, it was expressed using criticisms and hate speech. Furthermore, the Minister focused on several challenges (corruption in the sports sector, nepotism in the culture sector and the lack of professional staff also in the culture sector). In addition to the activities carried out during the reporting period, the Minister also addressed current developments, which exceeds the format of the Ministerial Hour. Such practice is unacceptable and does not align into the procedures of the Ministerial Hour. **Hence, it is recommended that the Minister is not given additional time to discuss other ongoing developments in this format.**

Following the address of the Minister, 16 MPs made speeches (12 – “Georgian Dream”, 2 – “European Socialists”, 1 – “People’s Power”, 1 – Independent MP).

⁵² The Official YouTube Page of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sWLP8JxGDh0&t=4s>, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PUE2NS1K7zc>, updated: 28.10.2023.

⁵³ The Parliament Plenary Session - 20.09.2023, Facebook Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/1363703404551583>, <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/876693173797667>, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁵⁴ A technical break was caused by the arrival of the female opposition MPs (Salome Samadashvili, Tina Bokuchava, Khatuna Samnidze and Tamar Kordzaia) at the podium of the Parliament and the unfolding of a banner with the inscription “the Georgian’ Dream’s Российский военный корабль иди на хуй!”. Shot 1:02:47, available at: <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/1363703404551583>, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁵⁵ The Government Programme 2021 – 2024 Toward “Building a European State”, available at: https://www.gov.ge/files/68_78117_645287_govprogramme2021-2024.pdf, updated: 12.03.2024.

The opposition did not attend the Ministerial Hour as a sign of protest, therefore, most of the questions were asked by members of the ruling party. The questions were largely formal in nature, and the MPs mainly asked the questions in order to thank the Minister and criticize the actions of female opposition members (and others). Critical questions were almost entirely absent.

The Hour of the Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development

The Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia, Levan Davitashvili, appeared before the Parliament on 4 October 2023.⁵⁶ 109 MPs registered at the Plenary Session. The address of the Minister lasted for 59 minutes.

At the beginning of his speech, the Minister said that he would present achievements, objectives and challenges to the MPs, however, he practically did not say anything about the latter.

In his speech, Levan Davitashvili began by reviewing economic indicators. He discussed the growth in economic activities in the country during 2023, highlighting record levels of exports, revenues from tourism, and foreign direct investments, as well as the reduction in unemployment rates, among other points.

The Minister also paid attention to the overall, and particularly 2023, outcomes of the “Enterprise Georgia” Programme. He touched upon topics such as bilateral economic relations, free trade, investment promotion, thorough and comprehensive Free Trade Agreement with the European Union, quality infrastructure, tourism and aviation, transportation, energy, internetization, innovations and technology, Spatial Planning Policy of Georgia, mining, property, the development of the capital markets and insurance sector, consumer product oversight, etc.

Following the speech procedure, a total of 41 MPs asked questions (23 – “Georgian Dream”, 4 – “UNM”, 3 – “People’s Power”, 2 – “For Georgia”, 2 – “Reforms Group”, 2 – “Freedom”, 1 – “Lelo”, 1 – “European Socialists”, 1 – “Euro-Optimists”, 2 – Independent MPs).

Within the format of the Ministerial Hour, the report of the Minister largely corresponded to the Government Programme.⁵⁷ The majority of questions were thematic. Formally, the procedure mostly aligned with the content outlined in the Ministerial Hour procedure.

As it could be concluded based on speeches, the Minister’s responses were not exhaustive for opposition MPs. The main question was who benefits from economic progress. The Minister’s speech was countered with negative outcomes (in areas such as migration, demographics, unemployment, and dependency on Russia).

Furthermore, the Minister avoided to talk about the allocation of funds from the budget for the repayment of debts for students with suspended status, and when asked again, he “redirected” the question to the Ministry of Education.

⁵⁶ The Parliament Plenary Session – Ministerial Hour - 04.10.2023, Facebook Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/1756203008161724>, <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/840693340830585>, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁵⁷ The Government Programme 2021 – 2024 Toward “Building a European State”, available at: https://www.gov.ge/files/68_78117_645287_govprogramme2021-2024.pdf, updated: 12.03.24.

The Hour of the Minister of Defence

The Minister of Defence of Georgia, Juansher Burchuladze, appeared before the Parliament on 17 October 2023.⁵⁸ At the beginning of the Session, 116 MPs registered. The address of the Minister lasted for 48 minutes. The Minister discussed topics such as strengthening Georgia's military capabilities, specifically in terms of air defence, anti-tank, artillery, and intelligence capabilities. He also focused on enhancing engineering capabilities, the restoration-modernization of aviation, equipping defence forces, and the steps taken towards rearming with NATO-standard equipment.

The Minister addressed the issue of modernizing infrastructure and logistics. He also spoke about institutional development and the role of the new Defence Code in promoting institutional progress. Regarding conscripts, he mentioned that starting from 2025, they will only be able to serve in the National Military Service within the Ministry of Defence system.

The Minister also addressed issues of cooperation, discussing the joint projects with both international organizations (the European Union and North Atlantic Treaty Organization), as well as with the U.S., European countries, and neighbouring countries. He also touched upon the policy of caring for soldiers and their families (salary increases, housing provisions, and other). Overall, the issues discussed by the Minister correspond to the Government Programme.⁵⁹

As a remark, it can be outlined that the speech of the Minister generally referred to the situation of the past years rather than specifically to 2023. It was very general and more informative in nature rather than being in the form of a report or a presentation. The Minister mainly used the term "in recent years". The speech lacked detailed discussion of specific actions. Therefore, the speech of Juansher Burchuladze, in this regard, did not meet the requirements set by the Rules of Procedure for the Ministerial Hour. **It is recommended that the Ministers adhere to the Rules of Procedure and, during this procedure, focus on reporting the implementation of the Government Programme within the past year.**

After the report, a total of 14 MPs asked questions (2 – "Georgian Dream", 4 – "UNM", 2 – "Girchi", 1 – "Reforms Group", 1 – "Citizens", 1 – "For National and Democratic State", 1 – "European Socialists", 1 – "Euro-Optimists", 1 – Independent MP).

The majority of questions were thematic. However, it appeared from the speeches that the Minister's answers to the MPs were not exhaustive. The Minister almost never addressed the challenges. One of the main challenges that emerged during the questions and speeches was the insufficient budget of the Ministry of Defence. The ruling party MPs mostly criticized the opposition and the previous government.

The Hour of the Minister of Regional Development and Infrastructure

The Minister of Regional Development and Infrastructure of Georgia, Irakli Karseladze, appeared before the Parliament on 2 November 2023.⁶⁰ At the beginning of the Session, 97 MPs registered. The address of the Minister overall lasted for 1 hour and 10 minutes.

The speech of the Minister was more detailed than his written report. Within the Ministe-

⁵⁸ The Ministerial Hour – The Minister of Defence, Juansher Burchuladze - 17.10.2023, Facebook Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/852089999961468>, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁵⁹ The Government Programme 2021 – 2024 Toward "Building a European State", available at: https://www.gov.ge/files/68_78117_645287_govprogramme2021-2024.pdf, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁶⁰ The Parliament Plenary Session – 02.11.2023, Facebook Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/1413098569553401>, <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/300442299550653>, updated: 12.03.2024.

rial Hour, Irakli Karseladze addressed issues such as: the construction of main roads and the development of road infrastructure (he spoke in detail about specific parts), construction-rehabilitation projects for water supply and drainage systems, the development of educational infrastructure, sports infrastructure, the “Renewed Regions” programme, non-hazardous waste management, decentralization, etc.

The minister identified one of the main challenges as the existence of *mala fide* contractors, which often leads to the termination of agreements, delays in projects, and sometimes even increases in costs.

A total of 37 MPs asked questions (15 – “Georgian Dream”, 5- “Reforms Group”, 4 – “UNM”, 4- “For Georgia”, 2 – “Euro-Optimists”, 1 – “European Socialists”, 2 – “People’s Power”, 2 – “Freedom”, 1 – “Girchi”, 1 – Independent MP).

In conclusion, it can be said that the speech of the Minister corresponded to the Government Programme,⁶¹ and the majority of the questions were thematic in nature.

The Hour of the Minister of Justice

The Minister of Justice of Georgia, Rati Bregadze, appeared before the Parliament on 17 November 2023.⁶² The speech was attended by the 108 MPs. The address of the Minister lasted overall for 46 minutes. Within the Ministerial Hour, Rati Bregadze outlined the steps taken in 2023 regarding the development of services and the projects to be completed in 2024. He also shared with the MPs the results of the “Systematic Land Registration” project and spoke about the “Systematic Addressing 2022-2024” project.

The Minister also addressed issues related to notary services and archive activities, the development of digital governance, the legislative initiatives of the Ministry, the representation of state interests before international courts, the prevention of legal disputes, the improvement of working conditions for employees within the Ministry, and other matters.

After the address, 26 MPs were active in questions (8 – “Georgian Dream”, 2 – “Reforms Group”, 4 – “UNM”, 1 – “For Georgia”, 2 – “Euro-Optimists”, 1 – “European Socialists”, 2 – “People’s Power”, 2 – “Freedom”, 2 – “Girchi” 1 – Independent MP, 1 – “For National and Democratic State”).

In the format of the Ministerial Hour, Rati Bregadze’s speech mostly covered the plans outlined in the Government Programme⁶³ and was thematic. A large part of the questions also followed this structure. However, the Minister’s response to questions related to President Saakashvili sparked an argument and caused a brief confrontation in the hall.

The Hour of the Minister of Education and Science

The Minister of Education and Science of Georgia, Giorgi Amilakhvari, appeared before the Parliament on 28 November 2023.⁶⁴ The exact number of MPs present is unknown, but at

⁶¹ The Government Programme 2021 – 2024 Toward “Building a European State”, available at: https://www.gov.ge/files/68_78117_645287_govprogramme2021-2024.pdf, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁶² The Parliament Plenary Session - 17.11.2023, Facebook Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/287127400973914>, <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/337132245585252>, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁶³ The Government Programme 2021 – 2024 Toward “Building a European State”, available at: https://www.gov.ge/files/68_78117_645287_govprogramme2021-2024.pdf, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁶⁴ The Official YouTube Page of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=s9dJI2y4Wfc>, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=cOwSecJHiWM>, updated: 05.03.2024.

the beginning of the day, 100 MPs had registered. The address of the Minister overall lasted for 54 minutes. At the beginning of his speech, the Minister mentioned that he was appointed in March 2023 but would present the report for the entire year of 2023.

During his speech, the Minister addressed several areas, specifically focusing on: the activities and future plans in pre-school, general, vocational, and higher education. His report on the field of science was comparatively brief, and the Minister emphasized that the state faces many challenges in this regard. When discussing pre-school education, the Minister highlighted two key points: 1. The concept of diversified pre-school education, and 2. The integration of bilingual education in all kindergartens.

The Minister's report was fully in line with the Government Programme in terms of content and was quite detailed.

During questions, 28 MPs asked questions (9 – “Georgian Dream”, 3 – “UNM”, 3 – “Reforms Group”, 2 – “For Georgia”, 1 – “European Socialists”, 2 – “Citizens”, 2 – “People's Power”, 2 – “Freedom”, 2 – “Girchi”, 1 – “Euro-Optimists”, 1 – Independent MP). The Minister answered all questions during his speech.

In conclusion, it can be said that the full procedure of Giorgi Amilakhvari's Ministerial Hour, both the Minister's presentation and the questions, was thematic.

The Hour of the State Minister for Reconciliation and Civic Equality

The State Minister for Reconciliation and Civic Equality, Tea Akhvlediani, appeared before the Parliament on 12 December 2023.⁶⁵ The address overall lasted for 40 minutes. The exact number of MPs present is unknown, but at the beginning of the day, 103 MPs had registered.

The State Minister mentioned during her speech that her work covers two directions, one focused on reconciliation and the other on civil equality. Accordingly, her report was also divided based on these directions.

When discussing reconciliation, the Minister addressed the issues present in the occupied regions. She also touched upon the matters of unlawful detentions and arrests, named the main challenges against peace processes, and discussed the strategy for civil equality and integration policies, as well as the 2023-2024 Action Plan.

During questions, 14 MPs asked questions (5 – “Georgian Dream”, 2 – “Reforms Group”, 2 – “Freedom”, 1 – “UNM”, 1 – “Girchi”, 1 – “European Socialists”, 1 – “Euro-Optimists”, 1 – Independent MP).

In her responses, the State Minister was critical towards the opposition and left many questions unanswered.

It is noteworthy that the Government Programme⁶⁶ contains very general references to reconciliation and civil equality, which complicates the assessment of the activities declared by the State Minister within the framework of the Ministerial Hour format, in relation to the policies outlined in the Programme. In the end, it can be said that Akhvlediani's speech was professional in nature. As for the questions, the majority of the MPs often used the question procedure merely for criticizing the opposition and praising the Government. The same tendencies were observed during the speeches. **For oversight purposes, it is important that MPs focus on thematic questions.**

⁶⁵ The Parliament Plenary Session (Part II) - 12.12.2023-12.12.2023, <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/1393962978144187>, The Parliament Plenary Session (Part III) - 12.12.2023, <https://www.facebook.com/parliamentgeo/videos/244497391816772>, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁶⁶ The Government Programme 2021 – 2024 Toward “Building a European State”, available at: https://www.gov.ge/files/68_78117_645287_govprogramme2021-2024.pdf, updated: 12.03.2024.

The 2024 Spring Session

The Hour of the Minister of Internal Affairs

The Minister of Internal Affairs of Georgia, Vakhtang Gomelauri, appeared before the Parliament on 20 March 2024.⁶⁷ The procedure was attended by 114 MPs. The address of the Minister lasted for 36 minutes. Within the framework of the Ministerial Hour, he reviewed the measures implemented in 2023 to effectively ensure law and order, and security; the Minister addressed issues, such as: the reform of the Criminal Police, the development of the Institute of Community Officers, the concept of analysis-based policing, the development of relevant infrastructure (opening new stations), international police cooperation, and international visits. The speaker paid significant attention to the organized and drug-related crimes. He also discussed the innovations implemented in terms of integrated border management, the steps taken to improve the activities of the Border Police, and the strengthening of Border Aviation.

In the end, the Minister addressed the development of the services, legislative amendments to be implemented under the initiative of the Ministry of Internal Affairs (“MIA”) (or the Government), plans for improving the activities of the Expert-Forensic Division, the activation of new institutions of restraining orders and risk assessment, information campaigns (regarding violence against women and early marriage), as well as events with regards to awareness-raising.

After the address, the procedure continued with the Q&A. A total of 19 MPs asked questions, out of whom 4 were from the “Georgian Dream”, 4 – “UNM”, 2 – “Reforms Group”, 3 – “Girchi”, 1 – “European Socialists”, 2 – “Euro-Optimists”, 2 – “Freedom” and 1 – “Lelo”.

During the questions of the opposition, there was sometimes noise in the hall, to which the Chairperson of the Parliament did not react.⁶⁸ The Minister answered almost all questions. For the most part, the answers were very general and brief. He frequently reiterated that he had already addressed these issues during his speech.

Five MPs employed their right to clarification. All of them were from the opposition. MP Roman Gotsiridze asked a question about the import of 22-million-dollar-worth aircraft from Qatar and the potential scheme for avoiding sanctions through the so-called third-country route to Russia. Shalva Papuashvili addressed Roman Gotsiridze, calling his statement disinformation and a campaign against the country. He justified his response by saying that, as Chairperson, one of his duties is to protect the dignity of the Parliament. It is noteworthy that the Chairperson of the Parliament violated the Rules of Procedure. More specifically, a Chairperson of a plenary sitting shall not have the right to comment on a speech of an MP or interrupt his/her speech for this purpose, or to evaluate a speech of an MP, or to answer a question not addressed to him/her personally, unless an MP violates the requirements of the Rules of Procedure.⁶⁹ While in this case, the speech of the MP did not violate the requirements of the Rules of Procedure. The Minister also answered clarifications very briefly and cursorily.

To conclude, it can be said that the speech of the Minister was somewhat professional in nature; the part of the questions was more referring to current developments rather than addressing the scope of authority of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and the one-year activity report. The plenary session was not adequately managed by the Chairperson. **It is essential**

⁶⁷ The Ministerial Hour – The Minister of Internal Affairs, Vakhtang Gomelauri, YouTube Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mPvZQHv27Ak>, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CoEB6Kzf4vA> updated: 15.04.2024.

⁶⁸ For example, during the questions posed by Khatia Dekanoidze and David Zilpimiani.

⁶⁹ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 90(4).

for the Chairperson of the Parliament to adhere to the requirements of the Rules of Procedure.

The Hour of the Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development

The Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia, Levan Davitashvili, appeared before the Parliament on 3 April 2024.⁷⁰ During the procedure, 116 MPs attended the speech of the Minister. The address lasted for 51 minutes. His speech referred to the topics, such as economic indicators and macroeconomic parameters, the efficient use of the country's capabilities and comparative advantages, the development of the private sector, legislative initiatives prepared by the Ministry, attracting direct and foreign investments, and various economic sectors (energy, tourism, aviation, infrastructure of transportation, internetization, spatial development, construction sector development, etc.). The Minister mainly focused on the measures taken in 2023 in the areas mentioned above and touched upon future plans.

After the address, the procedure continued with the Q&A. A total of 28 MPs asked questions, out of whom 14 were from the "Georgian Dream", 2 – "People's Power", 5 – "UNM", 3 – "Reforms Group", 1 – "European Socialists", 1 – "Euro-Optimists", 1 – "Lelo", and remaining 1 – without a faction.

The Minister answered most of the questions, but some questions still remained unanswered.⁷¹

Three MPs employed their right to clarification. All of them were from the opposition. The Minister also answered them.

Overall, the Minister's speech took place in a professional environment, and the Minister stayed within the scope of the issues within his competence. Regarding the questions, a challenge remains in the time allocated for questions, with opposition members often using it to position their stance, while members of the majority tend to use it for criticizing the opposition.

The Hour of the Minister of Finance

The Minister of Finance of Georgia, Lasha Khutsishvili, appeared before the Parliament on 21 February 2024.⁷² The speech of the Minister was attended by 103 MPs. The address lasted for 36 minutes. Lasha Khutsishvili spoke about macroeconomic indicators, focusing on inflation, as well as the volume of exports and imports. The minister also addressed the indicators of the budget performance.

Within the framework of the Ministerial Hour, the speaker also addressed issues such as: achievements in public finance management, state investment management, debt management, state-owned enterprise reforms, tax expenditures, tax and customs policies, tax disputes, tax liabilities, internal audit systems, financial management and control, the state

⁷⁰ The Ministerial Hour – The Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development, Levan Davitashvili, YouTube Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zk-16eimY-g> <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-bznJL8-Fz8>, updated: 22.04.2024.

⁷¹ For example, the question of Roman Gotsiridze regarding the payment of 10 million GEL to Rothschild Company without a ground (without providing services).

⁷² The Ministerial Hour – The Minister of Finance, Lasha Khutsishvili, YouTube Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PBSSXogzAFk>, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YI0kbG9f8XU>, updated: 11.05.2024.

policy on the gambling business, accounting and reporting, educational activities, the prevention of economic crimes and the fight against them, enforcement of sanctions, and international events. The Minister also briefly touched on the volume and distribution of the 2024 budget. Overall, the Minister's speech was professional in nature yet fully focused on successes. The Minister did not mention any challenges faced by the Ministry of Finance that have not been resolved up to this point.

After the address, the procedure continued with the Q&A. A total of 19 MPs asked questions, out of whom 5 were from the "Georgian Dream", 3 – "UNM", 2 – "Reforms Group", 3 – "People's Power", 2 – "European Socialists", 2 – "Euro-Optimists", 1 – "Freedom", and 1 from the "For Georgia". During the speech, the Minister answered the majority of the questions. He missed a few questions and asked that they be repeated for clarification.

The right to ask for clarification was used by three opposition MPs, and the Minister provided answers to them as well. Overall, the questions from the MPs, as well as the Minister's responses, were thematic. No significant procedural flaws were observed.

The Hour of the Minister of Environmental Protection and Agriculture

The Minister of Environmental Protection and Agriculture of Georgia, Otar Shamugia, appeared before the Parliament on 29 May 2024.⁷³ During the Session, 83 MPs registered. The address of the Minister lasted for 46 minutes.

In his report, the Minister dedicated a significant amount of time to discussing agricultural policy. The Speaker talked about the measures implemented under various programmes, including "Plan the Future", "The Programme for Promotion of Entrepreneurial Activity", a small equipment financing project for mountainous regions, the hazelnut subsidy program, agricultural insurance, the marine aquaculture programme, etc.

In his address, the speaker touched on legislative amendments initiated by the Ministry for the purposes of the environmental protection.

After the address, the procedure continued in a Q&A format. A total of 5 MPs asked questions, all of whom were from the "Georgian Dream" faction.

Overall, the speech of Otar Shamugia professional in nature and addressed the measures taken over the past year. He also responded comprehensively to questions. One problem was that, due to the ongoing political processes in the country, the opposition was largely absent from the Minister's speech, resulting in fewer critical questions. From a procedural perspective, no significant violations were observed.

The Hour of the Minister of Internally Displaced Persons from the Occupied Territories, Labour, Health and Social Affairs

The Minister of Internally Displaced Persons from the Occupied Territories, Labour, Health and Social Affairs of Georgia, Mikheil Sarjveladze, appeared before the Parliament on 30 May 2024.⁷⁴ During the Session, 80 MPs registered. The address of the Minister lasted for 33 minutes. The Minister started his speech by expressing gratitude, thanking Shalva Papuashvili, Irakli Kobakhidze, and Tea Tsulukiani.

⁷³ The Ministerial Hour - The Minister of Environmental Protection and Agriculture, Otar Shamugia - 29.05.2024, YouTube Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=X5spF0VHIYY>, updated: 07.13.2024.

⁷⁴ The Address of the Minister of Internally Displaced Persons from the Occupied Territories, Labour, Health and Social Affairs of Georgia, Mikheil Sarjveladze, YouTube Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BkeF6mPqsnq>, updated: 08.06.2024.

During the speech, the Minister followed topics thematically. First, he started talking about healthcare. During this part, he discussed the visits, meetings held in his capacity as Minister, as well as their outcomes. He also touched on the Universal Healthcare Programme, Hepatitis C Elimination Program, the Tuberculosis Control Program, primary healthcare issues, arranging the flights for children facing oncology for the purposes of treatment, etc.

The Minister actively addressed the challenges in the field. However, it should be noted that the Minister's speech was very brief and general, especially given that the Ministry of Health is one of the largest ministries, covering several key directions. The Minister frequently referred to the written report presented and deemed it unnecessary to repeat its content. Additionally, it should be noted negatively that the Minister placed less emphasis on the actions taken over the past year. Instead, the Minister largely reviewed the actions taken since the "Georgian Dream" came to power and compared the current situation to the condition of 2012.

After the address, the procedure continued in a Q&A format. A total of 13 MPs asked question, as follows: 11 – "Georgian Dream", 1 – "People's Power", 1 – "European Socialists". Mikheil Sarjveladze followed each question in detail and provided answers. This part seemed more professional and specific compared to the speech in general.

The Hour of the Minister of Education, Science and Youth

The Minister of Education, Science and Youth of Georgia, Giorgi Amilakhvari, appeared before the Parliament on 13 June 2024.⁷⁵ The speech of the Minister was attended by 33 MPs. The address lasted for 1 hour and 11 minutes.

While talking about education, the Minister traditionally divided his speech by educational levels. In the beginning, he started by discussing pre-school education, then moved on to general education, and continued with vocational and higher education issues.

Regarding science and youth affairs, he provided only minimal information.

After the address, the procedure continued in a Q&A format. A total of 14 MPs asked question, as follows: 9 – "Georgian Dream", 3 – "People's Power", 1 – "Girchi", 1 – "European Socialists".

Overall, the Minister's speech, as well as the questions addressed to him and the answers he provided, were professional in nature. It focused on the measures taken during the past year. A large portion of the opposition did not attend the Minister's speech, and as a result, the number of questions was relatively small, and their content was less critical.

4.3. Summoning of Accountable Officials to the Plenary Session

The Rules of Procedure of Parliament, in addition to the appearance of officials at the plenary session of their own will, also recognizes the possibility of summoning them. Based on the request of the committee or faction, with the support of the majority of the members of Parliament present, but not less than 1/3 of the full composition, it is possible to summon an accountable official to the plenary session of the legislative body, so that he/she can present a report of the activities performed and answer the questions.⁷⁶ Similar to the

⁷⁵ The Ministerial Hour - The Minister of Education, Science and Youth of Georgia, Giorgi Amilakhvari, YouTube Page of the Parliament, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ITdQcsyIW60&t=4s>, updated: 15.07.2024.

⁷⁶ The Constitution of Georgia, Article 44(6).

first two years of the Parliament of 10th Convocation,⁷⁷ this mechanism was not used in the 2023 Spring Session,⁷⁸ as well as 2024 Spring⁷⁹ and Fall⁸⁰ Sessions. Also, it was neither used in 2019-2020.⁸¹ The reason for this can be the quorum requirements and the passivity of the majority to use this mechanism. On the one hand, it should not be less than 1/3 of the full composition, but at the same time, it should be the majority of the members present. Sometimes the “majority of those present” is more than the votes of the opposition. In contrast, a majority that has the necessary votes to obtain a “majority of those present” is not interested in summoning its own Minister to the plenary session.

4.4. Interpellation⁸²

4.4.1. The Frequency of Holding Interpellations and the Time for Each Interpellation⁸³

The 2023 Spring Session

On 23 January 2023, in a format of interpellation, a group of 9 MPs addressed questions to the Prime Minister of Georgia.⁸⁴ According to the current provision of the Rules of Procedure, this interpellation should have been held by the last Friday of February 2023, on 24 February. However, the Prime Minister requested the Chairperson of the Parliament to address this interpellation within the framework of the next interpellation established by the Rules of Procedure, as a visit to the Republic of Turkey was scheduled for 23-24 February.⁸⁵ As a result, the Prime Minister’s interpellation took place on 24 March 2023.⁸⁶

On 7 September 2022, in a format of interpellation, a group of 7 MPs addressed questions to the Minister of Foreign Affairs.⁸⁷ On 19 September of the same year, the Minister of Foreign Affairs asked the Chairperson of the Parliament to postpone the interpellation, as during 20-26 September he was going to participate in the high-level week of the 77th Session of the United Nations General Assembly.⁸⁸ Later, on 21 February 2023, the Minister again re-

⁷⁷ Alaverdashvili G., Kapanadze N., Parliamentary Oversight in the Parliament of 10th Convocation of Georgia: Part One, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2023, 31.

⁷⁸ Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

⁷⁹ The Information provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

⁸⁰ The Information provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

⁸¹ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabaouri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2020, 27.

⁸² The theoretical discussion regarding this topic is provided in the first part of this research. Alaverdashvili G., Kapanadze N., Parliamentary Oversight in the Parliament of 10th Convocation of Georgia: Part One, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2023, 31-21.

⁸³ The previous experience regarding the frequency of holding interpellations is discussed in the first part of this research. Alaverdashvili G., Kapanadze N., Parliamentary Oversight in the Parliament of 10th Convocation of Georgia: Part One, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2023, 32-34.

⁸⁴ These MPs were, as follows: Teona Akubardia, Khatuna Samnidze, Taniel Nakaidze, Ana Buchukuri, Tamar Kordzaia, Mikheil Daushvili, Beka Liluashvili, Shalva Kereselidze and Armaz Akhvlediani. The Letter N567/3-2/23 of the Members of the Parliament of Georgia, 23 January 2023, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/24.03.2025/premieri/323714.pdf>, updated: 04.11.2023.

⁸⁵ The Letter N5517 of the Prime Minister of Georgia, 21 February 2023, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/321016?>, updated: 04.11.2023.

⁸⁶ The Official YouTube Page of the Parliament of Georgia, available at:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=whRDtSDFgWg>

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=oU8MYnsEwuQ>, updated: 04.11.2023.

⁸⁷ These MPs were, as follows: Teona Akubardia, Taniel Nakaidze, Ana Natsvlishvili, Giorgi Vashadze, Paata Manjgaladze, Khatuna Samnidze and Davit Bakradze. The Letter N8178/3-2/22 of the Members of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/18.11.2022/darchiashvili/kixva.pdf>, updated: 04.11.2023.

⁸⁸ The Letter N01/28430 of the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Georgia, 19 September 2022, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/306091?>, updated: 04.11.2023.

quested the postponement of the same interpellation.⁸⁹ Eventually, the Minister was heard on 24 March 2023.⁹⁰

Since both interpellations were scheduled for the same day, they were held in accordance with the Rules of Procedure. However, it is noteworthy that failure to appear at the designated time by the officials constitutes a violation of the Constitution, as, according to the Supreme Law, the addressee is obliged to answer questions at Parliament sittings.⁹¹ Although both individuals formally fulfilled this obligation, it was done with a violation of time limit. The provision of the Constitution should not be interpreted merely formally, as it would lose one of its primary functions in this process - reflecting or mirroring the perceptions of the society in which it operates. Instead of a formal Constitution, the idea of a “living Constitution” should be brought to the forefront. The purpose of an interpellation is for the Parliamentary group to receive responses from the executive on issues that are relevant at the time. When an official responds to questions with a delay of one month or nearly half a year, the relevance of the issue may naturally diminish or even disappear altogether. Therefore, it is essential for representatives of the executive branch to organize their activities in such a way that it does not hinder Parliament in fulfilling one of its constitutional roles – to oversight.

The 2023 Fall Session

On 14 August 2023, in a format of interpellation, faction “United National Movement – Unified Opposition ‘Unity Makes Strength’” sent a question to the Minister of Internal Affairs, Vakhtang Gomelauri,⁹² and the answer is dated 22 September 2023,⁹³ which is signed by the Minister himself. The addressee of the interpellation also appeared before Parliament on this date.

The interpellation question sent to the Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development is dated 10 April 2023,⁹⁴ and the Minister’s written response is dated 26 April 2023.⁹⁵ The letter is signed by the Minister himself, thus meeting the requirements prescribed by the Rules of Procedure. Additionally, although according to the Rules of Procedure, the addressee should have appeared before the Parliament on the last Friday of the plenary sessions of the current month, the interpellation took place on 22 September 2023, in violation to the Rules of Procedure. A similar case also took place during the previous session, which is assessed in the relevant subchapter.

⁸⁹ The Letter N01/5881 of the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Georgia, 21 February 2023, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/321017?>, updated: 04.11.2023.

⁹⁰ The Official YouTube Page of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=oU8MYnsEwuQ>, updated: 04.11.2023.

⁹¹ The Constitution of Georgia, Article 43(2).

⁹² The Interpellation of United National Movement – Unified Opposition ‘Unity Makes Strength’, The Letter N6181/3-9/23, available at: https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/22.09.2023/gomelauri/enm_14_08_2023.pdf, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁹³ The Written Response of the Minister of Internal Affairs of Georgia to the Questions of the Members of the Parliament in a Format of Interpellation, available at: https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/22.09.2023/gomelauri/mia_22_09_2023.pdf, updated: 12.03.2024.

⁹⁴ The Letter N 2711/3-17/23 of the Members of the Parliament of Georgia, Roman Gotsiridze, Nato Chkheidze, Tamar Kordzaia, Teona Akubardia, Khatia Dekanoidze, Davit Usupashvili, Armaz Akhvediani, Beka Liluashvili, Mikheil Daushvili, Salome Samadashvili and Ana Natsvlishvili, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/19.05.2023/davitashvili/kitxva-10.04.2023.pdf>, updated: 13.03.2024.

⁹⁵ The Letter N17/3273 of the Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/19.05.2023/davitashvili/pasukhi-26.04.2023.pdf>, updated: 13.03.2024.

On 12 September 2023, in a format of interpellation, a group of 9 MPs sent a question to Minister of Foreign Affairs Ilia Darchiashvili,⁹⁶ while the written response of the Minister was presented to the Parliament on 18 October 2023.⁹⁷ The response is signed by the Minister himself. The hearing took place on 20 October.⁹⁸

The 2024 Spring Session

The Interpellation of the Acting President of the National Bank

On 29 November 2023, in a format of interpellation, a group of 7 MPs sent a question to the Acting President of the National Bank, Natela Turnava.⁹⁹ The written response was sent to the Parliament on 22 February 2024.¹⁰⁰ The response is signed by the addressee herself.¹⁰¹ The requirements of the Rules of Procedure are complied in this regard. The Parliamentary hearing took place on 23 February 2024.¹⁰²

The Interpellation of the Minister of Internal Affairs

On 11 March 2024, in a format of interpellation, a group of 7 MPs sent a question to Minister of Internal Affairs Vakhtang Gomelauri.¹⁰³ The written response of the Minister was provided on 18 April,¹⁰⁴ while on 19 April – interpellation procedure took place.¹⁰⁵ The response is signed by the Minister himself.¹⁰⁶ The requirements of the Rules of Procedure are complied in this regard.

⁹⁶ The Letter N6705/3-2/23 of the Members of the Parliament of Georgia, Teona Akubardia, Khatuna Samnidze, Taniel Nakaidze, Tamar Kordzaia, Ana Buchukuri, Aleksandre Motserelia, Beka Liluashvili, Mikheil Daushvili and Shalva Kereselidze, available at: https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/20.10.2023_darchiashvili/kitxva-12.09.2023.pdf, updated: 13.03.2024.

⁹⁷ The Letter N01/35077 of the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Georgia, available at: https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/20.10.2023_darchiashvili/pasuxi-18.10.2023.pdf, updated: 13.03.2024.

⁹⁸ Interpellation – The Minister of Foreign Affairs of Georgia, Ilia Darchiashvili - 20.10.2023, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HfqpCjRz4il>, updated: 10.12.2024.

⁹⁹ The Letter N9125/3-26/23 of the Members of the Parliament of Georgia, Aleksandre Elisashvili, Teona Akubardia, Iago Khvichia, Aleksandre Rakviashvili, Herman Sabo, Vakhtang Megrelishvili and Ketevan Turazashvili to the Acting President of the National Bank of Georgia, Natela Turnava, available at: https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/2024/turnava/ask_19_11_2023.pdf, updated: 25.05.2024.

¹⁰⁰ The Letter N2-14/552 of the Acting President of the National Bank, Natela Turnava, to the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/356509?>, updated: 25.05.2024.

¹⁰¹ *ibid.*

¹⁰² The Interpellation – The Acting President of the National Bank, Natela Turnava - 23.02.2024, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FdAgU438vNg>, updated: 10.12.2024.

¹⁰³ The Letter N1726/3-2/24 of the Members of the Parliament of Georgia, Teona Akubardia, Ana Buchukuri, Ketevan Turazashvili, Nato Chkheidze, Khatia Dekanoidze, Ana Tsitslidze and Ana Natsvlshvili, to the Minister of Internal Affairs of Georgia, Vakhtang Gomelauri, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/19.04.2024/ask-11.03.2024.pdf>, updated: 25.05.2024.

¹⁰⁴ The Letter MIA 4 24 01176675 of the Minister of Internal Affairs of Georgia, Vakhtang Gomelauri, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/360610?>, updated: 25.05.2024.

¹⁰⁵ The Plenary Session of the Parliament - 19.04.2024, available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gT7aOOAO3wl>, updated: 25.05.2024.

¹⁰⁶ The Letter MIA 4 24 01176675 of the Minister of Internal Affairs of Georgia, Vakhtang Gomelauri, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/360610?>, updated: 25.05.2024.

The Interpellation of the Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development

A group of 8 MPs¹⁰⁷, in a format of interpellation, sent a question to the Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia, Levan Davitashvili, on 29 March 2024.¹⁰⁸ The Minister did not provide written response to the questions. Even more, despite being summoned to the Parliament on 10 April in a format of interpellation procedure, the Minister did not appear. Instead, the Acting Minister, Nino Enukidze, sent a letter to the Parliament on 18 April 2024,¹⁰⁹ informing them that the Minister had been on a business trip to the United Arab Emirates on 18-19 April to meet with potential investors in the energy sector, and, therefore, he could not appear before the Parliament in a format of interpellation. The mentioned letter outlined that the event had been scheduled well in advance. Therefore, it would have been possible to coordinate with the Minister and the addressees to select a new date for the interpellation. The provision of the Rules of Procedure, stating “as a rule” allows for some flexibility. The purpose of these words is to allow the Minister and the inviting persons to agree on a new date that would not cause the loss of its relevance. Hence, the date can be changed by a few days or at most one week from the original date. A change of more than that would make the topic less relevant, and the control mechanism would become illusory. In the present case at hand, the failure of the Minister to appear constitutes a violation of the Constitution and is a ground for impeachment.

4.4.2. The Conformity of the Interpellation Topic and Conducted Discussions

The 2023 Spring Session

The Interpellation of the Prime Minister

The questions sent in a format of interpellation to the Prime Minister addressed issues related to national security, the necessity to update conceptual documents in the field of national security, gathering of the National Security Council, strengthening critical infrastructure, the defence budget, and cooperation with Western partners to strengthen defence capabilities. Additionally, the MPs were interested in how the Government planned to develop a common national vision for de-occupation and peaceful settlement of conflict as called upon with the Resolution, as well as the approval of a National Strategy to Combat Hybrid Threats.¹¹⁰

The 113 MPs registered for the session. Prior to the speech, MP Khatuna Samnidze asked whether the written response from the Prime Minister had been existed.¹¹¹ According to the MP, the provision of a written response is prescribed by the Rules of Procedure. The Chairperson of the Parliament confirmed that such a response had been delivered to the Parliament. The ruling party MP also provided clarification on the matter. According to them, the interpellation procedure does not require the written response to be submitted several days in advance, but the addressee of the interpellation is obliged to present the written response before appearing before Parliament; therefore, distributing the written response

¹⁰⁷ Among them were, as follows: Armaz Akhvlediani, Teona Akubardia, Roman Gotsiridze, Khatia Dekanoidze, Aleksandre Elisashvili, Ketevan Turazashvili, Ana Natsvlshvili and Davit Khajishvili.

¹⁰⁸ The Letter N2326/3-3/24 of the Members of the Parliament of Georgia, 29 March 2024, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/360459?>, updated: 13.07.2024.

¹⁰⁹ The Letter № 04/2636 of the Acting Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development, Nino Enukidze, 18 April 2024, to the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/360611?>, updated: 13.07.2024

¹¹⁰ The Letter N567/3-2/23 of the Members of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/24.03.2025/premieri/323714.pdf>, updated: 04.11.2023.

¹¹¹ The Response of the Prime Minister, 14 March 2023, N8894, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/24.03.2025/premieri/323715.pdf>, updated: 04.11.2023.

to MPs in advance is not prescribed by the Rules of Procedure. Afterwards, the Prime Minister also confirmed that the written response had been delivered to the Parliament on the morning of the interpellation day. Following this, Khatuna Samnidze asked for a 5-minute technical break to allow the MPs to get acquainted with the written response; the request was rejected by the Chairperson of the Parliament.

The speech of the Prime Minister lasted for about 40 minutes, which is 10 minutes longer than the maximum duration prescribed by the Rules of Procedure.¹¹² After the speech of the Prime Minister, the Chairperson of the Parliament commented on this issue and stated that it would be fair to give the speakers more time than prescribed by the Rules of Procedure, in order to allow them to present comprehensive answers. As stated by Papuashvili, he would follow this approach (meaning adding time) for future interpellations as well. Such an approach indicates a lack of comprehensive understanding of the principle of a legal state. When a legal norm imperatively establishes a specific rule of conduct, no matter how unacceptable it may seem to someone, compliance with it is mandatory. The principle - *dura lex, sed lex* - the law is harsh, but it is the law – applies. Hence, if a particular provision of the Rules of Procedure is flawed, it should be reviewed in accordance with the procedure established by the Constitution. Otherwise, the Rules of Procedure is the law, and the other actors, especially parliamentary subjects, must adhere to it.

It is noteworthy that the Prime Minister's speech and the written responses presented to the Parliament differed significantly from each other, both rhetorically and substantively. The written response is composed in an official style and extensively addresses the questions sent by the MPs, whereas the Prime Minister's verbal speech was mainly dedicated to criticizing political opponents and discussing the so-called "second front" narrative. Additionally, the majority of the MPs who delivered remarks only partially addressed the questions within a general context.

This practice does not align with the essence of the interpellation mechanism. Its purpose is to receive a response to the sent questions during the plenary session. Therefore, both the questions and the answers in the session are strictly defined by the content of the interpellation. Other issues may be addressed through different forms of oversight or the same mechanism if the author submits a question related to them.

The Interpellation of the Minister of Foreign Affairs

The interpellation questions sent to the Minister of Foreign Affairs addressed the actions of the Russian Federation in the occupied territories of Georgia (such as the transfer of the Bichvinta country house to Russian ownership, the restoration of the Sukhumi airport, etc.) and Georgia's diplomatic reaction to these actions. Furthermore, the questions concerned the Government's anti-Western rhetoric, steps taken towards European integration, as well as specific visits and meetings of the Prime Minister.¹¹³ Asking fundamentally different questions within a single interpellation hinders the true purpose of the mechanism, which is to allow for an in-depth examination of the topic. This trend has also been observed in previous years.¹¹⁴ **Therefore, it is recommended to exclude the possibility of asking different questions under one interpellation.**

¹¹² The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament of Georgia, Article 149(8).

¹¹³ The Letter N8178/3-2/22 of the Members of the Parliament of Georgia, 7 September 2022, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/interpelacia/18.11.2022/darchiashvili/kitxva.pdf>, updated: 04.11.2023.

¹¹⁴ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers' Association, 2020, 34.

The speech of the Minister lasted about for 20 minutes. Before the commencement of the procedure, the Chairperson of the Parliament expressed hope that an hour and a half would be sufficient for the procedure, as the Minister had to leave afterward in order to host the Foreign Minister of Germany. Shalva Papuashvili also mentioned that, in case of time constraints, a two-hour break could be declared, and the procedure could be resumed afterward.

The author of the question, Teona Akubardia, pointed out that the questions sent to the Minister seven months ago might no longer be relevant.

According to the Minister, although he was unable to appear before the Parliament for seven months, he “provided a substantiated response.” It is vague whether the substantiated response refers to answering the questions within the interpellation or to providing an explanation for his absence.

In the format of delivering remarks, some of the opinions expressed by the MPs, as well as the questions posed, went beyond the content of the interpellation questions. The Chairperson of the Parliament also pointed this out during the speech of MP Fridon Injia. According to Papuashvili, interpellation has a specific thematic focus, and this procedure should not be confused with the Ministerial Hour. Papuashvili again emphasized the limited time. Due to the lack of time, the Minister practically did not make a final speech and only addressed the MPs with a few phrases.

The practice indicates that, despite improvements in regulations, the issue of time for interpellation remains problematic. **Legislators must ensure that the procedure is structured in a way that allows the interpellation to proceed comprehensively.**

The 2023 Fall Session

The Interpellation of the Minister of Internal Affairs

The interpellation sent to the Minister of Internal Affairs addressed the prediction of the landslide processes in Shovi, the timely warning and evacuation of the population, the criminal negligence of high-ranking officials, the implementation of an early warning system, the reasons for the delay of the search and rescue operations in Shovi, the failure to request assistance from neighbouring states, the condition of the rescue equipment of the MIA Emergency Management Service and its compatibility with international standards. Additionally, it questioned the reasons for the state’s refusal to purchase a search and rescue helicopter (“HUEY II”) through a grant, as well as the Ministry’s position on the matter.

The address of the Minister lasted about for 28 minutes. His speech was in accordance with the written response. It is noteworthy that the speakers were going beyond the content of the interpellation. **During the procedure, it is essential that the Q&A session refers to the content of the questions sent in a format of interpellation.** Any discussion on other topics constitutes a violation of the Rules of Procedure.

The Interpellation of the Minister of Foreign Affairs

The interpellation sent to the Minister of Foreign Affairs concerned the participation of the Parliament and the Government in the decision-making process, the absence of a reference regarding the recognition of Georgia’s independence and territorial integrity in the joint statement on establishing strategic partnership, the impact of strategic cooperation with China on Georgia’s foreign policy, the country’s accession to the European Union and NATO,

the effect of participation in the 14+1 format on the country's economic situation, multilateralism, and the shift in the country's foreign policy vector.

While asking a question, Teona Akubardia pointed out that she had previously addressed the Minister with a parliamentary question on the same issue, to which a response was not provided and the delay amounted to 70 days. It can be said that in some cases, MPs resort to the interpellation procedure because they do not receive answers from the accountable officials to parliamentary questions. Therefore, interpellation remains an alternative means for obtaining answers.

The 2024 Spring Session

The Interpellation of the Acting President of the National Bank

The questions of the interpellation were presented by Ketevan Turazashvili. They were related to the pension loans issued by "Liberty Bank", specifically addressing several issues: the high interest rates on pension loans, the extension of loan terms by "Liberty Bank" during the pandemic for benefiting from the "grace period", so-called "overdrafts", the enforcement problems related to the return of loans to the "old framework", etc. The authors of the interpellation were interested in whether Turnava was aware of these issues, whether the National Bank had developed any recommendations or specific mechanisms to resolve these problems. In case of a negative answer, they requested a substantiated justification. Additionally, the interpellation authors were interested to know the reasons why there were no recommendations regarding the return of public loans to the "old framework".

The speech of Natela Turnava lasted for 30 minutes. She answered the questions raised through interpellation in detail. Her speech was thematic and fully followed the written response.

During the speeches, the members of parliament went beyond the scope of the interpellation questions and focused on other issues related to the scope of authority of the National Bank. Additionally, the majority of the ruling party members' speeches were focused on criticizing the opposition, and *vice versa*.

In her concluding statement, Turnava also addressed the questions and concerns raised by the MPs during their speeches. Overall, no significant procedural flaws were observed. However, the discussion of issues beyond the scope of the interpellation remains a problem. **It is important that only the questions raised in the interpellation be discussed within this format, and that the speaker does not diverge from them.**

The Interpellation of the Minister of Internal Affairs

The interpellation questions were sent by Teona Akubardia; the content of the questions referred to, on the one hand, domestic violence and violence against women, and, on the other hand, drug-related crimes. The MPs were interested in the measures implemented by the Ministry in various areas and requested the sharing of particular information. In addition to the written questions, Akubardia also asked about developments that were taking place during that period¹¹⁵ and regarding the political responsibility of the Minister in relation to those developments.

¹¹⁵ It refers to the physical abuse of Aleko Elisashvili by the Special Task Forces. See, "Police physically assaulted me, I have a broken rib" — Aleko Elisashvili, Netgazeti, available at: <https://netgazeti.ge/life/718590/>, updated: 10.12.2024. Additionally, the MP asked about the Minister's responsibility regarding individuals injured during protests against Russian laws.

The Minister's speech lasted for approximately 40 minutes. He began his response by commenting on the developments that were taking place at the time (the protests)¹¹⁶, stating that there had been insults directed at police officers, attempts to force their way to the state institutions, etc. The Minister's remarks were followed by an uproar in the session hall, which culminated in the expulsion of opposition MP Salome Samadashvili from the hall.

While moving to the interpellation questions, Vakhtang Gomelauri expressed his dissatisfaction and stated that he had already addressed these issues a month ago (referring to the Ministerial Hour format). The Minister followed the written response and answered each question individually. It should be noted that the Ministerial Hour and the interpellation mechanism are fundamentally different. They serve different purposes. Therefore, discussing specific issues in one format does not preclude the possibility of a more in-depth discussion in another format.

Overall, the interpellation took place in a rather tense atmosphere and exceeded the scope of the interpellation questions. This was further exacerbated by the expulsion of MP Samadashvili from the hall and the accompanying reactions. During the speech, with the exception of a few rare instances, attention was barely paid to the interpellation issues. The majority of the discussion focused on the assault of MP, the developments during the protests, etc.

It is important that the interpellation procedure does not exceed the scope of the questions posed within it. The discussed practice illustrates that during interpellations, the emphasis is often placed on issues that are currently relevant and initial questions posed in the interpellation format are overshadowed. Furthermore, as the examined examples demonstrate, Ministers sometimes request the postponement of interpellations for specific periods, sometimes even for several months. Due to this reason, GYLA has been advocating for establishing "question time" procedure in the Parliament for years.¹¹⁷ The purpose of the Question Time is to discuss important, current issues of the given period and to receive responses from the relevant Minister.¹¹⁸ The right to ask questions during such a procedure is granted to one MP, faction or a small group of MPs,¹¹⁹ and they should receive an answer promptly.¹²⁰ The introduction of this mechanism in the Parliament of Georgia will alleviate the interpellation process and create an opportunity to discuss relevant questions derived from it within a new format. Additionally, the Question Time will fill the gap in oversight regarding the answers of the executive branch and accountable individuals related to current developments, when the Parliament needs an answer promptly. This will not overload either the interpellation or the Ministerial hour procedures with off-topic questions, and will contribute to in-depth discussions on the issues at hand.

4.4.3. The Connection of Interpellation with the Procedure of No-Confidence

According to the Constitution of Georgia, an official's answer to an interpellation may become a subject of consideration by Parliament.¹²¹ While, the Rules of Procedure outlines the adoption of a resolution after the completion of the procedure.¹²² The Rules of Procedure

¹¹⁶ It refers to the 2024 Spring protests against the Russian Law.

¹¹⁷ Menabde V., Alavardashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., *The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform*, Georgian Young Lawyers' Association, 2020, 25-27. See, also, pp. 19-20 of the First Part of this research.

¹¹⁸ *ibid*, 25.

¹¹⁹ *ibid*, 25-27.

¹²⁰ *ibid*, 27.

¹²¹ The Constitution of Georgia, Article 43(2).

¹²² The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament of Georgia, Article 149(11).

does not explicitly prescribe what should be included in such a resolution. It reflects the Parliament's stance on the responses of the interpellation addressee. Furthermore, neither the Constitution nor the Rules of Procedure provide for a clear link between the interpellation and the no-confidence procedure. However, it is not unknown to European states.¹²³

It is true that according to the Constitution of Georgia, the answer received during interpellation may become a reason for a debate, however, to what extent this entails its transformation into the motion no-confidence procedure is a matter of clarification. Neither does the Rules of Procedure shed a light on the issue. It also allows for the adoption of a resolution, although not in a mandatory form, but in case of wish of the Parliament.¹²⁴ It is for the Supreme Law of Georgia to share the European experience and to establish the possibility of linking the interpellation with the procedure of no-confidence. It would be desirable for the adoption of the resolution to be linked to the so-called resolution of censure, which would serve as the basis for initiating the procedure of no-confidence.

After the completion of interpellations during the 2022 Spring Session, the Parliament did not adopt a resolution.¹²⁵ Similarly, no resolution was adopted by Parliament during the 2023 Spring and Fall Sessions,¹²⁶ nor during the 2024 Spring Session¹²⁷.

Furthermore, during the 2022 Spring Session, the Parliament did not adopt a resolution of no-confidence.¹²⁸ This issue was not placed on the agenda in the 2023 Spring and Fall Sessions,¹²⁹ nor in the 2024 Spring Session¹³⁰.

In Georgia, the principle of collective responsibility of the Government is established. However, previous editions of the Constitution allowed the Parliament to raise the issue of individual responsibility of a Minister before the Prime Minister.¹³¹ Furthermore, for some time, the Prime Minister was required to present a reasoned decision to the Parliament if a Minister was not dismissed from their position.¹³² Subsequent amendments removed the obligation to present a reasoned decision, but the Parliament retained the right to raise the issue of the accountability of a Minister.¹³³

According to a comparative study conducted by GYLA, it has been revealed that in several European countries, where semi-presidential and parliamentary models are established,¹³⁴ such as Croatia, Slovakia, Estonia, Latvia and Greece, legislative branch is empowered to individually declare no-confidence against specific members of the Government.¹³⁵ The establishment of a similar mechanism in Georgia could potentially open the way for the easy dismissal of individual undesirable Ministers, when the Government, in general, is acceptable to the Parliament.

¹²³ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers' Association, 2020, 34.

¹²⁴ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament of Georgia, Article 149(11).

¹²⁵ The Information Provided by the Letter N10651/2-7/22 of the Parliament of Georgia, 7 November 2022.

¹²⁶ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

¹²⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

¹²⁸ The Information Provided by the Letter N10099/2-7/22 of the Parliament of Georgia, 25 October 2022.

¹²⁹ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

¹³⁰ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

¹³¹ The Constitution of Georgia, the Editions of 6 February 2004 and 15 October 2010, Article 59(3).

¹³² The Constitution of Georgia, the Edition of 6 February 2004, Article 59(3).

¹³³ The Constitution of Georgia, the Edition of 15 October 2010, Article 59(3).

¹³⁴ Kapanadze N., The Individual Responsibility of a Minister as a Mechanism of Parliamentary Oversight, Georgian Young Lawyers' Association, 2022, 5-9.

¹³⁵ *ibid.*

4.5. Temporary Commission

Similar to the 2021 and 2022 Sessions¹³⁶ of the Parliament of 10th Convocation, neither during the 2023 Spring¹³⁷ nor the 2023 Fall Sessions¹³⁸, a resolution on establishing a Temporary Commission was registered. The same situation remained during the 2024 Spring¹³⁹ and Fall¹⁴⁰ Sessions.

4.6. Temporary Commission of Inquiry

The 2023 Spring Session

During the 2023 Spring Session of the Parliament of Georgia, three resolutions were registered regarding the establishment of the Temporary Commissions of Inquiry. The first one concerned to look into the transnational crimes committed by organized criminal groups through fraudulent “call centres” and the possible inadequate response to these crimes,¹⁴¹ the second referred to the transfer of land plots, registered by the Public Registry, to private individuals in 2020, prior to the Parliamentary Elections, and the results of the initiated investigation into this matter,¹⁴² and the third one aimed to study the causes of the natural disaster in Shovi, the response to it, and the lawfulness of the actions of certain state institutions and officials.¹⁴³ With regards to the first Commission, the MPs of the “Georgian Dream” did not register for the session, and an artificial barrier was created to prevent the issue from being put to a vote.¹⁴⁴ In the second case, there was no problem with the registration process, but there were not enough votes to pass it.¹⁴⁵ As for the third case, the initiator of the Commission of Inquiry postponed to place it on the agenda.¹⁴⁶ Eventually, none of the aforementioned Commissions of Inquiry were established.¹⁴⁷

The 2023 Fall Session

During the 2023 Fall Session, there was no request for the establishment of a Temporary Commission of Inquiry in the Parliament of Georgia.¹⁴⁸

¹³⁶ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2020, 40-41.

¹³⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

¹³⁸ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

¹³⁹ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

¹⁴⁰ The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/#law-drafting>, updated: 12.12.2024.

¹⁴¹ Resolution №07-3/314, 26.04.2023, the Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

¹⁴² Resolution №2-8220/23, 25.05.2023, the Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

¹⁴³ Resolution №07-3/346, 21.08.2023, the Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

¹⁴⁴ “Georgian Dream” also hindered the establishment of an Commission of Inquiry on call centres, available at: <https://netgazeti.ge/news/670518/>, updated: 12.12.2024.

¹⁴⁵ Vote Report, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/334786?>, updated: 12.12.2024.

¹⁴⁶ The request to establish the Commission of Inquiry on the Shovi disaster was postponed by the “United National Movement” until October, available at: <https://www.radiotavisupleba.ge/a/32579046.html>, updated: 12.12.2024.

¹⁴⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

¹⁴⁸ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

The 2024 Spring Session

During the 2024 Spring Session, the opposition MPs¹⁴⁹ requested the establishment of a Temporary Commission of Inquiry to look into the alleged unlawful enrichment and possible corruption crimes during the term of former Prime Minister Irakli Garibashvili.¹⁵⁰ However, the Parliament did not reach a decision regarding its establishment.¹⁵¹

¹⁴⁹ These MPs were, as follows: Tamar Kordzaia, Ketevan Turazashvili, Teona Akubardia, Khatia Dekanoidze, Ana Buchukuri, Beka Liluashvili, Shalva Kereselidze, Mikheil Daushvili, Roman Gotsiridze, Taniel Nakaidze, Davit Usupashvili, Shalva Shavgulidze, Aleksandre Elisashvili, Tamar Charkviani, Levan Khabeishvili, Kakhaber Okriashvili, Devi Chankotadze, Akaki Minashvili, Tinatin Bokuchava, Levan Bezhashvili, Abdula Ismailov, Ramaz Nikolaishvili, Davit Kirkitadze, Giorgi Botkoveli, Ekaterine Kherkheulidze, Giorgi Godabrelidze, Davit Khajishvili, Sulkhan Sibashvili, Ani Tsitlidze, Teimuraz Janashia, Gubaz Sanikidze, Koba Nakopia, Paata Manjgaladze, Armaz Akhvlediani and Ana Natsvlishvili.

¹⁵⁰ The initiative regarding the establishment of the Temporary Commission of Inquiry, see, the Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/#law-drafting/28390>, updated: 22.11.2024.

¹⁵¹ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

V. THE QUESTION OF THE MEMBER OF THE PARLIAMENT

2023

In 2023, 42 Members of the Parliament sent 3001 written questions. The answer was received to 2212 of them, while 789 questions have not yet been responded to.¹⁵² It is noteworthy that in 2023, the vast majority of the unanswered questions were written by opposition representatives.

In 2023, a total of 140 questions were asked to the authorities responsible for defence and security sectors. Of these, 138 were written by the opposition, and 2 - by the majority. Out of the questions posed by the opposition, 93 were related to security issues. A timely response was given to 52 of those questions, 16 remained unanswered, and 25 received delayed responses. The questions posed by members of the majority did not address security issues. Out of the security-related questions, 47 responses were signed by the relevant individual, while 28 were signed by others.

In total, 68 of the asked questions received timely responses, 24 remained unanswered, and 48 received delayed responses. 68 responses were signed by the relevant individual, while 46 were signed by others.

2024

In 2024, 30 Members of the Parliament sent 742 written questions. The answer was received to 602 of them, while 140 questions have not yet been responded to.¹⁵³ It is noteworthy that 97% of the questions were written by the opposition, while it is noteworthy that in 2023, the vast majority of the unanswered questions were also written by opposition representatives.

In 2024,¹⁵⁴ a total of 45 questions were asked to the authorities responsible for defence and security sectors. Out of these, 31 questions did not relate to security issues. Of the questions posed, 1 was written by a member of the majority, and 44 - by the opposition. Regarding the responses, 26 questions received timely answers within the prescribed deadlines by the Rules of Procedure, 12 received delayed responses, and 7 questions remained unanswered. Of the answered questions, 37 responses were signed by the relevant addressee or the head of the relevant authority, while in 1 case, the response was signed by someone who was not the relevant addressee or head of the authority.

¹⁵² The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023. The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

¹⁵³ The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, Questions of the Member of the Parliament, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/#mpqs>, updated 24.12.2024.

¹⁵⁴ As of 17 September.

VI. COMMITTEE CONTROL MECHANISMS

6.1. Obligation to Provide Information

The 2023 Spring Session

During the reporting period, the Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee requested information from various institutions in 6 cases.¹⁵⁵ Particularly, a request for information regarding the status of the activities defined by the transitional provisions of the laws of Georgia was made to the executive authorities 5 times (the sending dates are: 29.03.2023, 09.06.2023, 20.06.2023, 24.07.2023 - twice), while a request for the position of the Government of Georgia on the legislative proposal presented for discussion in the Committee was made once (sending date 19.07.2023).¹⁵⁶ The Committee received written responses to the above-mentioned requests in accordance with the deadlines provided by the Rules of Procedure of the Parliament of Georgia.¹⁵⁷ Other Committees of the Parliament did not exercise this authority.¹⁵⁸

The 2023 Fall Session

During the 2023 Fall Session, the Committees did not exercise this authority.¹⁵⁹

The 2024 Spring Session

During the 2024 Spring Session, the Committees did not exercise this authority.¹⁶⁰

6.2. Summoning of Officials to Committee Sitting

6.2.1 Summoning of Officials by a Majority of the Committee Members

The 2023 Spring Session

None of the Committees summoned any official by a majority of attendees at their sitting.¹⁶¹

It is noteworthy that neither the Prime Minister, the General Prosecutor, nor the Head of the State Security Service was summoned to the Committee sitting.¹⁶²

The 2024 Spring Session

During the 2024 Spring Session, none of the Committees summoned any official by a majority of attendees at their sitting.¹⁶³ In addition, neither the Prime Minister, the General Prosecutor, nor the Head of the State Security Service was summoned to the Committee sitting.¹⁶⁴

¹⁵⁵ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

¹⁵⁶ *ibid.*

¹⁵⁷ *ibid.*

¹⁵⁸ *ibid.*

¹⁵⁹ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

¹⁶⁰ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

¹⁶¹ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

¹⁶² *ibid.*

¹⁶³ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

¹⁶⁴ *ibid.*

This authority was used in 2019-20 for 5 times,¹⁶⁵ while in 2021-22 – for 4 times.¹⁶⁶ As for summoning the Prime Minister, the General Prosecutor, and the Head of the State Security Service, this issue was never raised in the agenda.¹⁶⁷ Additionally, in 2023, the GYLA submitted a legislative initiative to the Parliament regarding certain amendments to the Rules of Procedure, including in the area of committee control mechanisms.¹⁶⁸ This was discussed by the Procedural Issues and Rules Committee, and following a formal discussion, it was rejected.¹⁶⁹ Furthermore, it is noteworthy that the proposal was submitted to Parliament by the GYLA in May 2023, while the Committee considered it in October of the same year. The five-month delay in discussing the issue highlights the importance of Parliamentary oversight for the Parliament itself.

6.2.2. Summoning an Official to a Committee Sitting by a Faction

The 2023 Spring Session

On 3 April 2023, the political group – “Lelo – Partnership for Georgia” – addressed the Human Rights and Civil Integration Committee of the Parliament with a request to invite the Minister of Internally Displaced Persons from the Occupied Territories, Labour, Health and Social Affairs. Based on this request, the Committee heard the Minister’s responses to the issues raised by the political group on 19 April.

According to the request of 30 March 2023 of the political group – “Reforms Group”, the Minister of Internal Affairs of Georgia was invited to the sitting of the Defence and Security Committee of the Parliament of Georgia. This request was sent to the Minister of Internal Affairs within the time frame established by the Rules of Procedure. Additionally, based on the requests of 22 June 2023 of the political groups “Reform Group” and “For Georgia”, the Minister of Defence was also invited to the same committee sitting. However, the Minister of Defence attended the Committee sitting during the Fall Session, as outlined in the relevant subchapter below. The invited officials provided information on the reasons for their absence at the committee sitting.¹⁷⁰ It should be outlined that such actions constitute a violation of the Constitution.¹⁷¹ This, in turn, serves as grounds for the initiation of impeachment proceedings against these ministers. If an invited official is unable to attend the session, there is a mechanism that allows for the determination of a new date based on an agreement between the initiator of the invitation and the invited person.¹⁷²

¹⁶⁵ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2020, 42.

¹⁶⁶ Alaverdashvili G., Kapanadze N., Parliamentary Oversight in the Parliament of 10th Convocation of Georgia: Part One, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2023, 49.

¹⁶⁷ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2020, 42. Alaverdashvili G., Kapanadze N., Parliamentary Oversight in the Parliament of 10th Convocation of Georgia: Part One, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2023, 49.

¹⁶⁸ The legislative proposal presented by the Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association (Nona Kurdovanidze) on “the Amendments to the Rules of Procedure of the Parliament” regarding the draft of the Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, available at: <https://parliament.ge/legislation/26401>, updated: 12.12.2024.

¹⁶⁹ The Letter N2-16206/23 of the Procedural Issues and Rules Committee to the Bureau of the Parliament, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/341926>, updated: 12.12.2024.

¹⁷⁰ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

¹⁷¹ See, Article 44(6) of the Constitution.

¹⁷² The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 40(4).

The 2023 Fall Session

On 31 October 2023, the political group – “Euro-Optimists” addressed the Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee with a request to invite the Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development to the committee sitting.¹⁷³ Based on this request, the Committee heard the Minister on 18 December 2023.¹⁷⁴

As mentioned in the above sub-chapter, based on the request of 22 June 2023 of the parliamentary political groups “Reforms Group” and “For Georgia”, the Minister of Defence was invited to the sitting of the Defence and Security Committee.¹⁷⁵ Based on this request, the Committee heard the Minister on 4 October 2023.¹⁷⁶

It is recommended that the Minister attend the committee sitting within a reasonable period following the invitation, so that MPs can receive timely answers on the relevant issues at that time.

The 2024 Spring Session

During the 2024 Spring Session, the factions did not exercise this authority.¹⁷⁷

6.3. The Thematic Rapporteur of the Committee

6.3.1. The Action Plans of the Committee and the Appointment of a Thematic Rapporteur

Both in 2023 and 2024, all committees developed an action plan.¹⁷⁸ The assessments of GYLA with regards to the structure and directions of the action plans have already been presented in the first part of the research; therefore, there will be no further discussion in the second part, as the committee have not changed their approach in 2023 and 2024. It is noteworthy that, alongside the committees, the Trust Group established in Parliament also has an action plan, which has been classified as secret.¹⁷⁹ Therefore, the action plan of the Trust Group is not examined or discussed in this research.

In accordance with an action plan of the committee, the working field/fields or direction/directions of a thematic rapporteur shall be determined annually. One thematic speaker from among the MPs in the parliamentary majority, and, if desired, one thematic speaker from among the opposition, is designated for each working field.¹⁸⁰ If no one expresses a wish to be a thematic speaker for the working field, the Chairperson of Committee shall himself/herself designate a thematic speaker.¹⁸¹ In addition, based on the decision of the Chairperson of the Committee, more than 2 speakers may be appointed in the same working field.¹⁸²

¹⁷³ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

¹⁷⁴ *ibid.*

¹⁷⁵ *ibid.*

¹⁷⁶ *ibid.*

¹⁷⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

¹⁷⁸ See, Table N1 and N4.

¹⁷⁹ The 2024 Action Plan of the Defence and Security Committee, 11.

¹⁸⁰ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 45(3).

¹⁸¹ *ibid.*, Article 45(4).

¹⁸² *ibid.*, Article 45(3).

The 2023 Action Plans

In 2023, all committees appointed thematic rapporteurs,¹⁸³ a total of 92 MPs. Of these, 73 are from the majority, while 19 – from the opposition. The Action Plans of the Committees prescribe a total of 895 issues. Of these, chairpersons of the committee (a total of 14) were designated as rapporteurs for 594 issues,¹⁸⁴ while the first deputies of the Chairpersons (a total of 13) were appointed for 285 issues.

The 2024 Action Plans

In 2024, all committees appointed thematic rapporteurs,¹⁸⁵ a total of 90 MPs. Of these, 73 are from the majority, while 17 – from the opposition. The Action Plans of the Committees prescribe a total of 717 issues. Of these, chairpersons of the committee (a total of 13) were designated as rapporteurs for 493 issues, while the first deputies of the Chairpersons (a total of 13) were appointed for 222 issues.¹⁸⁶

Such an approach deforms the real purpose of the institution, which represents the allocation of workload among the MPs.¹⁸⁷ Therefore, **the responsibilities should be equally allocated among the committee members.**

It is noteworthy that during 2023, MPs left their parliamentary membership 8 times, and also left committee membership 8 times, yet in none of these cases were the action plans updated. In 2024, MPs left parliamentary membership 3 times, and committee membership once. **It is recommended that in such cases, the corresponding changes be reflected in the action plans.**

6.3.2. The Identity of the Thematic Rapporteur

The 2023 Action Plans

A thematic rapporteur is appointed from the members of relevant committee. The action plan must clearly specify the name and surname of the MP responsible for each specific direction. In 6 of the 2023 Action Plans, it was outlined that committee members were designated as rapporteurs.¹⁸⁸ Such a general reference makes it impossible to identify the relevant thematic rapporteur, when necessary.

In the Defence and Security Committee, there were 5 rapporteurs from the majority and 1 from the opposition.¹⁸⁹ Of the 5 rapporteurs from the majority, 2 left the Committee in March.¹⁹⁰ Therefore, the topics they had chosen, which cover a total of 31 issues,¹⁹¹ remained unaddressed.

¹⁸³ See, Table N1.

¹⁸⁴ *ibid.*

¹⁸⁵ See, Table N4.

¹⁸⁶ *ibid.*

¹⁸⁷ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 45(1).

¹⁸⁸ See, Table N1.

¹⁸⁹ *ibid.*

¹⁹⁰ *ibid.*

¹⁹¹ *ibid.*

The 2024 Action Plans

In 5 of the 2024 Action Plans, it was outlined generally that committee members were designated as rapporteurs.¹⁹² In addition, in 3 cases, the member of the Staff of the Committee was also determined as a rapporteur.¹⁹³

In the Defence and Security Committee, there were 4 rapporteurs from the majority and 1 from the opposition.¹⁹⁴ The Chairperson of the Committee left the Parliament in April, and as a result, the 27 issues he had chosen remained unaddressed.¹⁹⁵

The cases discussed above represent a misunderstanding of the essence of a thematic rapporteur. Therefore, it is essential that a thematic rapporteur is appointed solely as a natural person, with their name and surname specified, rather than a legal entity or a subject referred to by general terms.

It is important that when MPs leave a committee or the Parliament, the issues they were responsible for be reassigned to the remaining or newly joined members of the committee. The Rules of Procedure should include a provision that obligates the committee to allocate issues taken on by the departing member to others in a reasonable timeframe shortly after the shift.

6.3.3. The Reporting of a Thematic Rapporteur

The 2023 Action Plans

The thematic rapporteurs were obliged to present a report to the Committee regarding the issues within their competence.¹⁹⁶ During 2023, 4 rapporteurs presented reports in four different committees.¹⁹⁷ Among them were not the members of the Defence and Security Committee.

The 2024 Action Plans

During the 2024 Spring Session, 4 rapporteurs presented reports in four different committees.¹⁹⁸ Among them were not the members of the Defence and Security Committee.

It is recommended that rapporteurs properly fulfil their obligations and present the relevant reports to the committees.

¹⁹² See, Table N4.

¹⁹³ *ibid.*

¹⁹⁴ *ibid.*

¹⁹⁵ *ibid.*

¹⁹⁶ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 45(6).

¹⁹⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023, and the Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

¹⁹⁸ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

6.4. Thematic Inquiry

6.4.1. Creating a Thematic Inquiry Group

The 2023 Spring Session

During the 2023 Spring Session, in total, 9 thematic inquiry groups were created in the Parliament.¹⁹⁹ According to the Rules of Procedure, both a committee and a standing council of Parliament have the authority to create this group.²⁰⁰ During the session, all groups were established by the committees.²⁰¹ In each case, the decision to create a thematic inquiry group was made during the relevant committee sitting.²⁰²

The Education and Science Committee established thematic inquiry groups on the following topics: the impact of the condition of infrastructure and human resources in early and pre-school education institutions on the delivery of quality education; assessing the impact of students' social and emotional conditions on academic achievements and the effectiveness of existing support mechanisms; the practice of adhering to sanitary-hygienic standards and school doctor regulations in educational institutions and existing challenges; identifying the challenges faced by public higher educational institutions in Georgia's regions and developing support mechanisms; and identifying priorities in vocational education that align with the labour market and analysing the funding model. The Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee established a thematic inquiry group on the legislative framework for the development of innovation-promoting instruments. The Diaspora and Caucasus Issues Committee created a group on the topic: involvement of the Diaspora in Georgia's development: attracting sustainable capital from the diaspora. The Sport and Youth Affairs Committee created a group on the prevention and rehabilitation policy regarding adolescents and youth's attitudes toward lotteries, gambling, and betting games, the challenges, and potential solutions. The Healthcare and Social Issues Committee established a group on the accessibility of mental health services in Georgia and the existing challenges.

The 2023 Fall Session

During the 2023 Fall Session, 4 thematic inquiry groups were created in the Parliament.²⁰³ All of them were established by the Committees, accompanied with relevant decisions.²⁰⁴

During this Session, the Agrarian Issues Committee established a group on the topic of accessibility to finance in the agricultural sector (within the context of private financial institutions); this time, the Education, Science and Youth Affairs Committee created one group on the topic of school community involvement in the managing process of general education institutions; The Culture Committee established a group on the inclusion of students with disabilities in the arts education institutions, both public and private; The Healthcare and Social Issues Committee – on the topic of accessibility to oncology services in Georgia and the existing challenges.

¹⁹⁹ Table #2.

²⁰⁰ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 155(1).

²⁰¹ Table #2.

²⁰² The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

²⁰³ Table #2.

²⁰⁴ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

The 2024 Spring Session

During the 2024 Spring Session, 2 thematic inquiry groups were created.²⁰⁵ Both of them were established by the Committees.²⁰⁶ One group was created during a joint sitting of three committees.²⁰⁷ During this sitting, a joint group was formed by the Committees on Education, Science and Youth Affairs, Diaspora and Caucasus Issues, and Culture regarding the strengthening of the activities of Georgian weekend schools (including in the field of arts education) abroad, as well as strengthening the activities of ensembles. The Regional Policy and Self-Government Committee formed a group on the topic of the role of decentralization and the challenges for ensuring equal socio-economic development of municipalities.

It is noteworthy that the Defence and Security Committee does not use this mechanism. During the 10th Convocation of the Parliament, the Committee has not created any thematic inquiry group.²⁰⁸ While, during the 9th Convocation of the Parliament, only one group was formed with the Foreign Affairs Committee.²⁰⁹

6.4.2. The Principle of Formation of a Group

For years, the Georgian Young Lawyers' Association has called on the Parliament to apply the principle of proportional representation of factions when forming thematic inquiry groups.²¹⁰ However, no such provision has been included in the Rules of Procedure.

The 2023 Spring Session

During the 2023 Spring Session, this principle was violated.²¹¹ Only one group managed to somewhat reflect the proportional representation of the forces existing in Parliament.²¹² Therefore, the recommendation of the GYLA remains valid, that groups should be formed based on the mentioned principle.

The 2023 Fall Session

This principle was again violated during the 2023 Fall Session.²¹³ Out of the groups created during this session, only one maintained approximate proportional representation.²¹⁴

The 2024 Spring Session

During the 2024 Spring Session, the mentioned principle was not considered during the formation of the groups.²¹⁵

²⁰⁵ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

²⁰⁶ *ibid.*

²⁰⁷ *ibid.*

²⁰⁸ With regards to 2021-22, see, Alaverdashvili G., Kapanadze N., Parliamentary Oversight in the Parliament of 10th Convocation of Georgia: Part One, Georgian Young Lawyers' Association, 2023, 62-64.

²⁰⁹ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers' Association, 2020, 135.

²¹⁰ *ibid.*, 60.

²¹¹ See, Table #3.

²¹² *ibid.*, this was the thematic inquiry group formed by the Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee regarding the legislative framework for the development of innovation-promoting instruments.

²¹³ *ibid.*

²¹⁴ *ibid.* This was the group formed by the Healthcare and Social Issues Committee regarding accessibility to oncology services in Georgia and the existing challenges. It is recommended to apply the principle of proportional representation of factions when forming thematic inquiry groups.

²¹⁵ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

6.4.3. Number of Members in a Group

The 2023 Spring Session

The Rules of Procedure do not determine the number of members of the thematic inquiry group. During the 2023 Spring Session, two groups with four members were created, 2 groups – with 2 members, 3 groups – with 3 members, one group – with 6 members and another one – with 9 members.²¹⁶

The thematic inquiry group should be flexible in order to promptly provide the Committee or the Standing Council with expert opinion on problematic issues. It is positive that in the 10th Convocation of Parliament, there is a noticeable trend toward the creation of smaller groups. It is recommended to create thematic inquiry groups with fewer members, the number of which should not exceed 1/3 of the members of the forming subject.

The 2023 Fall Session

During the 2023 Fall Session, 2 groups with 3 members each, 1 group with 4 members, and 1 group with 8 members were created.²¹⁷

It is positive that the trend of creating flexible, smaller groups maintained in the 2023 Fall Session, as well.

The 2024 Spring Session

During the spring session of 2024, 2 groups were created, one consisting of 4 members and the other of 10 members.²¹⁸

It is commendable that the trend of creating flexible groups continues.

6.4.4. Group Membership

Any deputy can become a member of the thematic inquiry group, and the Rules of Procedure do not impose any restrictions in this regard. GYLA's position is that a member of a

²¹⁶ See, Table #3. There were 4-member groups on thematic inquiry regarding the legislative framework for the development of innovation-promoting instruments, and the practice of adhering to sanitary-hygienic standards and school doctor regulations in educational institutions and existing challenges. The 2-member groups were regarding the impact of the condition of infrastructure and human resources in early and pre-school education institutions on the delivery of quality education, and identifying priorities in vocational education that align with the labour market and analysing the funding model. The 3-member groups were regarding the prevention and rehabilitation policy regarding adolescents and youth's attitudes toward lotteries, gambling, and betting games, the challenges, and potential solutions, as well as assessing the impact of students' social and emotional conditions on academic achievements and the effectiveness of existing support mechanisms. The 6-member group was formed regarding the accessibility of mental health services in Georgia and the existing challenges, while the 9-member group was formed regarding the involvement of the Diaspora in Georgia's development: attracting sustainable capital from the diaspora.

²¹⁷ *ibid.* The 3-member groups were those regarding the involvement of school community in the managing process of general education institutions, and the inclusion of students with disabilities in the arts education institutions, both public and private. The 4-member group was regarding the accessibility to finance in the agricultural sector (within the context of private financial institutions). The 8-member group was regarding the accessibility to oncology services in Georgia and the existing challenges.

²¹⁸ *ibid.* The 4-member group was created regarding the strengthening of the activities of Georgian weekend schools (including in the field of arts education) abroad, as well as strengthening the activities of ensembles, while the 10-member group was formed regarding the role of decentralization and the challenges for ensuring equal socio-economic development of municipalities.

group can only be a member of the entity that created it.²¹⁹ During the 2023 Spring Session, this principle was violated in 4 groups in 5 cases.²²⁰ This is a violation of the Rules of Procedure. **It is recommended that, on one hand, when starting thematic research, the group members should be members of the founding subject, and on the other hand, the requirements of the Rules of Procedure should be complied with during its formation.**

6.4.5. The Term of Authority of the Group and Its Opinion

The term of authority of a thematic inquiry group is three months which may be extended for not more than 2 months.²²¹ Within the groups formed during the 2023 Spring Session, 6 of them prepared the opinions in breach of the deadline.²²² These were the groups, as follows: the impact of the condition of infrastructure and human resources in early and pre-school education institutions on the delivery of quality education; assessing the impact of students' social and emotional conditions on academic achievements and the effectiveness of existing support mechanisms; the practice of adhering to sanitary-hygienic standards and school doctor regulations in educational institutions and existing challenges; identifying the challenges faced by public higher educational institutions in Georgia's regions and developing support mechanisms and identifying priorities in vocational education that align with the labour market and analysing the funding model.²²³ Within the additional 2-month period, 2 groups presented their opinions.²²⁴ These were, as follows: Thematic Inquiry regarding "the legislative framework for the development of innovation-promoting instruments" and regarding "the prevention and rehabilitation policy regarding adolescents and youth's attitudes toward lotteries, gambling, and betting games, the challenges, and potential solutions".²²⁵ Whilst, one has not presented the opinion.²²⁶ This was the thematic inquiry group regarding the involvement of the Diaspora in Georgia's development: attracting sustainable capital from the diaspora.²²⁷ During the committee sitting, the opinion of the the-

²¹⁹ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers' Association, 2020, 60-61.

²²⁰ See, Table #3.

²²¹ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 155(8).

²²² See, Table #2.

²²³ Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee Hearing Recommendations Drafted Based on Thematic Inquiry, available at: <https://parliament.ge/en/media/news/dargobrivi-ekonomikisa-da-ekonomikuri-politikis-komitetmatematuri-mokvlevis-safudzvelze-shemushavebuli-rekomendatsiebi-moismina>, updated: 22.01.2024. Healthcare and Social Issues Committee Deliberating on Conclusions and Recommendations Drafted by the Thematic Inquiry Group, available at: <https://parliament.ge/media/news/janmrtelobis-datsvisa-da-sotsialur-sakitkhta-komitetmatematuri-mokvlevis-jgufis-mier-momzadebuli-daskvna-da-rekomendatsiebi-ganikhila>, updated: 22.01.2024.

²²⁴ Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee Hearing Recommendations Drafted Based on Thematic Inquiry, available at: <https://parliament.ge/en/media/news/dargobrivi-ekonomikisa-da-ekonomikuri-politikis-komitetmatematuri-mokvlevis-safudzvelze-shemushavebuli-rekomendatsiebi-moismina>, updated: 22.01.2024. Healthcare and Social Issues Committee Deliberating on Conclusions and Recommendations Drafted by the Thematic Inquiry Group, available at: <https://parliament.ge/en/media/news/janmrtelobis-datsvisa-da-sotsialur-sakitkhta-komitetmatematuri-mokvlevis-jgufis-mier-momzadebuli-daskvna-da-rekomendatsiebi-ganikhila>, updated: 22.01.2024.

²²⁵ Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee Hearing Recommendations Drafted Based on Thematic Inquiry, available at: <https://parliament.ge/media/news/dargobrivi-ekonomikisa-da-ekonomikuri-politikis-komitetmatematuri-mokvlevis-safudzvelze-shemushavebuli-rekomendatsiebi-moismina>, updated: 22.01.2024. Healthcare and Social Issues Committee Deliberating on Conclusions and Recommendations Drafted by the Thematic Inquiry Group, available at: <https://parliament.ge/media/news/janmrtelobis-datsvisa-da-sotsialur-sakitkhta-komitetmatematuri-mokvlevis-jgufis-mier-momzadebuli-daskvna-da-rekomendatsiebi-ganikhila>, updated: 22.01.2024.

²²⁶ See, Table #2.

²²⁷ Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee Hearing Recommendations Drafted Based on Thematic Inquiry, available at: <https://parliament.ge/en/media/news/dargobrivi-ekonomikisa-da-ekonomikuri-politikis-komitetmatematuri-mokvlevis-safudzvelze-shemushavebuli-rekomendatsiebi-moismina>, updated: 22.01.2024. Healthcare

matic inquiry group regarding the the impact of the condition of infrastructure and human resources in early and pre-school education institutions on the delivery of quality education was heard.²²⁸ In addition, the Committee was presented the opinion of the group regarding “the prevention and rehabilitation policy regarding adolescents and youth’s attitudes toward lotteries, gambling, and betting games, the challenges, and potential solutions”.²²⁹ The Bureau was presented with the opinions of the following groups: assessing the impact of students’ social and emotional conditions on academic achievements and the effectiveness of existing support mechanisms; the practice of adhering to sanitary-hygienic standards and school doctor regulations in educational institutions and existing challenges; identifying the challenges faced by public higher educational institutions in Georgia’s regions and developing support mechanisms; identifying priorities in vocational education that align with the labour market and analysing the funding model and thematic inquiry regarding the legislative framework for the development of innovation-promoting instruments. In these cases, when the opinion of a group created by one committee is directly submitted to the Bureau without being discussed by the committee, it does not comply with the requirements of the Rules of Procedure.²³⁰ During the 2023 Fall Session, 3 groups developed their opinions after the deadline. These were thematic inquiries, as follows: the involvement of school community in the managing process of general education institutions, and the inclusion of students with disabilities in the arts education institutions, both public and private, and the accessibility to oncology services in Georgia and the existing challenges.²³¹ Within the additional 2-month period, 1 group presented their opinion.²³² This was a thematic inquiry regarding the accessibility to finance in the agricultural sector (within the context of private financial institutions).²³³ None of the groups created during the 2024 Spring Session have developed their opinions and continue their work.²³⁴ It is recommended to adhere to the requirements of the Rules of Procedure.

Within the scope of the previous research, during the 2022 Fall Session, the terms 2 out of 3 groups had not been expired yet, while the term of one group had expired, however, the opinions were adopted late.²³⁵ At this stage, both groups have submitted their opinions.²³⁶ The committees reviewed the opinions and approved them.²³⁷

and Social Issues Committee Deliberating on Conclusions and Recommendations Drafted by the Thematic Inquiry Group, available at: <https://parliament.ge/en/media/news/janmrtelobis-datsvisa-da-sotsialur-sakikhkha-komitetma-tematuri-mokvlevis-jgufis-mier-momzadebuli-daskvna-da-rekomendatsiebi-ganikhila>, updated: 22.01.2024.

²²⁸ See, Table #2.

²²⁹ *ibid.*

²³⁰ For example, see, the Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 155(8).

²³¹ See, Table #2.

²³² *ibid.*

²³³ *ibid.*

²³⁴ *ibid.*

²³⁵ Alaverdashvili G., Kapanadze N., Parliamentary Oversight in the Parliament of 10th Convocation of Georgia: Part One, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2023, 66-68.

²³⁶ The Opinion of the Thematic Inquiry of the Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee on the State of the Digital Economy and its Development Prospect, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/tematuri-mokvleba/dargobrivi/cifruli-ekonomika/daskvna-cifruli-ekonomika.pdf>, updated: 23.01.2024. The Thematic Inquiry on “Access to Education Adopted to Market Demand in Modern Agricultural and Environmental Fields”, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/tematuri-mokvleba/agrari-ganatleba-garemo/mokvlevis%20angarishi/NDI-tematuri-mokvleba.pdf>, updated: 23.01.2024.

²³⁷ The Session Minutes N12 of the Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/353052?>, updated: 23.01.2024. Presentation of a thematic inquiry on “Accessibility to Education Tailored to the Market Demands in Modern Agrarian and Environmental Directions”, available at: <https://parliament.ge/en/media/news/tematuri-mokvlevis-prezentatsia-bazris-motkhovnazemorgebuli-ganatilebis-khelmisatsvdomoba-tanamedrove-agrari-da-garemosdatsviti-mimartulebebit>, updated: 23.01.2024.

During the reporting period, the Rules of Procedure are again violated by the thematic inquiry groups. On the one hand, the groups are not able to prepare the opinions within the prescribed timeline. Therefore, **it is recommended that the Rules of Procedure outline the possibility to determine the term of authority of a group in each specific case taking into account the specifics of the issue.**²³⁸ **It is essential to develop a recommendation and send it to relevant addressees. Otherwise, the work of a Thematic Inquiry Group would be like an academic activity, which does not serve the purposes of parliamentary oversight.**²³⁹

6.5. Establishment, Composition and Term of Authority of the Working Group

During 2023-24, a total of 8 working groups were established. Below, they are discussed in detail. In addition, it is noteworthy that, within two years, no working group was established on any issue in the Defence and Security Committee. It should also be outlined that this trend of this Committee is observed specifically in the 10th Convocation of the Parliament.²⁴⁰

According to the current regulation in force, at the discretion of the committee, the working group may include PMs, representatives of government agencies and relevant subject-matter experts, as well as other interested persons.²⁴¹ The previous edition prescribed the inclusion of both MPs and subject-matter experts.²⁴² The current edition repeats the previous approach, stating that the involvement of subject-matter experts in the working group is not mandatory, but rather facultative. Therefore, the recommendation of GYLA remains valid, emphasizing the obligation to involve both subject-matter experts and the MPs.²⁴³

Furthermore, it is commendable that in the new convocation of Parliament, committees create working groups based on a vote, based on the Committee Acts. This complies with the requirements of the Rules of Procedure.

The 2023 Spring Session

During the 2023 Spring Session, 2 committees created 3 working groups.²⁴⁴

The Human Rights and Civil Integration Committee established a working group during its sitting on 26 April 2023, with the aim of assessing the advisability of considering the proposals outlined in the 2022 Report of the Public Defender of Georgia “On the Situation of Protection of Human Rights and Freedoms in Georgia”.²⁴⁵ The term of the group was set for 3 months.²⁴⁶ The initiator of its creation was the Chairperson of the Committee, and the creation was supported by 7 members of the committee, 6 of whom are from the parliamentary majority and 1 from the opposition.²⁴⁷ The group consisted of 18 members, 3 from the opposition and 15 from the majority.²⁴⁸ It did not include the subject-matter expert.

²³⁸ GYLA has been advocating for this for years. Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2020, 62.

²³⁹ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2020, 65.

²⁴⁰ *ibid*, 144.

²⁴¹ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 46(1).

²⁴² *ibid*, Article 46 (prior to the amendments of 7 June 2022).

²⁴³ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2020, 70.

²⁴⁴ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

²⁴⁵ *ibid*.

²⁴⁶ *ibid*.

²⁴⁷ *ibid*.

²⁴⁸ *ibid*.

The Healthcare and Social Issues Committee, by its own decision, established two working groups – one for the duration of three months regarding the support to employment of persons with disabilities, and another one for 5 months regarding the issues of pensions.²⁴⁹ The first group consists of 11 members.²⁵⁰ From this members, 3 are from majority, 6 – representatives from the executive branch, and 2 - experts.²⁵¹ The second working group consists of 12 members,²⁵² including 6 from the majority, 1 from the opposition, and 5 from the executive branch.²⁵³ By the decision of 3 July 2023 of the Committee, the working group on the support to employment of persons with disabilities was given a 3-month extension until 25 October of the current year.²⁵⁴ The working group on pension issues was expected to submit a report to the Committee by 20 November.²⁵⁵ Eventually, the report was submitted to the Committee on 5 December, exceeding the term of the group's authority.²⁵⁶

The 2023 Fall Session

During the 2023 Fall Session, 2 working groups were created in 2 committees.

During the 19 October 2023 sitting, the Agrarian Issues Committee established a working group – “Georgian Wheat Culture – Traditions and Rituals”. The Chairperson of the Committee proposed the creation of the working group, which was unanimously supported by 12 members of the committee.²⁵⁷ The working group consists of 4 members from the majority.²⁵⁸ It is also composed of various individuals, both internal and external experts to the Parliament, overall, 10 people.²⁵⁹ Hence, the group is represented by 14 members. The term of authority was 3 months, after which the group completed its work.²⁶⁰

During the 10 November 2023 sitting, the Human Rights and Civil Integration Committee, at the initiative of the Committee Chairperson, created a working group, which was supported by 6 members of the committee;²⁶¹ all of whom were from the parliamentary majority.²⁶² The aim of the group was to examine the advisability of implementing the initiative proposed in the petition “Therapy with Paws”, submitted by 2040 Georgian citizens, regarding the adoption and care of stray animals by prisoners in penitentiary institutions.²⁶³ The group

²⁴⁹ *ibid.*

²⁵⁰ The Decision of the Healthcare and Social Issues Committee of the Parliament of Georgia regarding the Establishment of the Working Group of the Committee, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/jandacva/samushao-jgufebi/shshm/samushao-jgufi-shshm.pdf>, updated: 24.01.2024.

²⁵¹ *ibid.*

²⁵² The Decision of the Healthcare and Social Issues Committee of the Parliament of Georgia regarding the Establishment of the Working Group of the Committee, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/jandacva/samushao-jgufebi/sapensio/sapensio-jgufi.pdf>, updated: 24.01.2024.

²⁵³ *ibid.*

²⁵⁴ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

²⁵⁵ The Decision of the Healthcare and Social Issues Committee of the Parliament of Georgia regarding the Establishment of the Working Group of the Committee, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/jandacva/samushao-jgufebi/sapensio/sapensio-jgufi.pdf>, updated: 24.01.2024.

²⁵⁶ Information about the results of the activities of the working group on pension issues created by the Healthcare and Social Issues Committee, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/jandacva/samushao-jgufebi/sapensio/info-samushao-jgufis-shedegebi.pdf>, updated: 24.04.2024.

²⁵⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

²⁵⁸ *ibid.*

²⁵⁹ *ibid.*

²⁶⁰ *ibid.*

²⁶¹ *ibid.*

²⁶² *ibid.*

²⁶³ *ibid.*

consists of 5 MPs, all from the majority, and 7 members, of whom 6 are from various public institutions and 1 is a citizen.²⁶⁴ The term of authority for the group was 2 months.²⁶⁵

During this period, the Sports Committee has not established a working group; however, the working group – “On the Development of State Youth Policy” – created on 7 November 2022 continues its work until 1 October 2024.²⁶⁶ The initiator of its creation was MP Givi Mikanadze, who received unanimous support from 7 members of the committee.²⁶⁷ The group consists of 4 MPs from the majority and 14 representatives from both the public and private sectors.²⁶⁸

The 2024 Spring Session

During the 2024 Spring Session, on 4 June, only one working group was created in the Legal Issues Committee.²⁶⁹ The group was established to facilitate the determination of the compliance of the candidates for the Supreme Court judges, nominated by the High Council of Justice for selection by Parliament, with the requirements of the law.²⁷⁰ The group was composed of both MPs and representatives of government institutions, as well as relevant subject-matter experts.²⁷¹ The working group consisted of 17 MPs, 15 of whom were representatives of the “Georgian Dream”, 1 from “People’s Power”, and another 1 from “European Socialists”.²⁷² Additionally, the group included 2 members who were subject-matter experts.²⁷³ The working group operated for 17 days.²⁷⁴ During this period, it held 2 sessions, after which it completed its work.²⁷⁵

6.6. Studying the Work of Administrative Bodies

According to the Rules of Procedure, the Committee, on its own initiative or on the basis of a respective application, request or petition, shall within its competence examine the activities of administrative bodies and shall, where necessary, request relevant materials and submit its opinion to the Parliament for discussion.²⁷⁶ Neither during the 2023 Spring nor Fall Sessions did any committee use this mechanism.²⁷⁷ This authority was not used by committees in the 2024 spring session either.²⁷⁸ This mechanism has not been used in the 10th Convocation of Parliament.²⁷⁹ Committees can achieve specific objectives using other control mechanisms, which is why they do not resort to this one. Therefore, it is recommended to remove it from the Rules of Procedure.

²⁶⁴ *ibid.*

²⁶⁵ *ibid.*

²⁶⁶ *ibid.*

²⁶⁷ *ibid.*

²⁶⁸ *ibid.*

²⁶⁹ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

²⁷⁰ *ibid.*

²⁷¹ The Opinion of the Legal Issues Committee, N2-9039/24, 24 June 2024, the Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/365854?>, updated: 11.11.2024.

²⁷² *ibid.*

²⁷³ *ibid.*

²⁷⁴ *ibid.*

²⁷⁵ *ibid.*

²⁷⁶ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 37(3).

²⁷⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023, and the Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

²⁷⁸ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

²⁷⁹ Menabde V., Alaverdashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers’ Association, 2020, 41-42.

6.7. Entities of Parliamentary Oversight over the Security Sector

6.7.1. The Defence and Security Committee

The Defence and Security Committee is the leading parliamentary entity responsible for overseeing the security sector.²⁸⁰ This committee, by its nature, is equipped with all the committee oversight mechanisms prescribed by the Rules of Procedure. These mechanisms were discussed above, and it was outlined how passive the committee has been in employing them. For years, the GYLA has been advocating for the reform of the Defence and Security Committee. Its mandate and the scope of its oversight subjects are quite large. Therefore, in order to ensure proper oversight, GYLA considers it advisable to split the Committee into two full-fledged committees, which will subsequently improve the quality of oversight.²⁸¹

In 2024, the leadership of the Committee underwent changes. By the decision of the Prime Minister, Irakli Beraia, who had previously been the Chairperson of the Committee, became the head of the Intelligence Service.²⁸² His first deputy, Aleksandre Tabatadze, was selected as the new Chairperson of the Committee.²⁸³ Such personnel changes undermine the essence of parliamentary oversight. A person who used to oversee an institution now becomes its head; while this person must now be overseen by his former colleagues. In such a situation, doubts arise regarding whether the Defence and Security Committee will be able to properly oversee the Intelligence Service. Furthermore, considering the political realities in Georgia and the fragile nature of democracy, it is unlikely that former colleagues will effectively scrutinize their teammate.

6.7.2. Trust Group

6.7.2.1. The Convocation of the Trust Group and Its Quorum

A session of the Trust Group is unilaterally convened by the Chairperson.²⁸⁴ Any member of the Trust Group can propose the convocation of the Trust Group, but it requires the support of a majority of members.²⁸⁵ Under the conditions, where the majority quota is 3 out of 5 members according to the Rules of Procedure, it is difficult to imagine how a member appointed from the opposition quota could convene a meeting. This situation denies the opposition the opportunity to call a meeting on topics of interest to them. It is recommended that each member of the group have the right to convene a meeting.

During the 2023 Spring Session, the Trust Group held 8 sittings,²⁸⁶ while during the Fall Session – 6 sittings.²⁸⁷ During the 2024 Spring Session, the Trust Group held 4 sittings,²⁸⁸ and during the 2024 Fall Session – 1 sitting.²⁸⁹

²⁸⁰ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 156.

²⁸¹ Menabde V., Alavardashvili G., Gerliani T., Jabauri A., Odikadze N., The Parliamentary Oversight since the Constitution and the Rules of Procedure Reform, Georgian Young Lawyers' Association, 2020, 49-51

²⁸² Irakli Kobakhidze Appointed Irakli Beraia as the Head of Intelligence Service, available at: <https://www.radiotavisupleba.ge/a/32892452.html>, updated: 17.12.2024.

²⁸³ The Position of the Chairperson of the Parliament's Defence and Security Committee was taken by the "Georgian Dream" MP, Aleksandre Tabatadze, available at: <https://www.interpressnews.ge/ka/article/795704-parlamentis-tavdacvisa-da-ushishroebis-komitetis-tavmjdomaris-tanamdeboba-kartuli-ocnebis-deputatma-aleksandre-tabatazem-daikava/>, updated: 17.12.24.

²⁸⁴ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 158(2).

²⁸⁵ *ibid.*

²⁸⁶ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

²⁸⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

²⁸⁸ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

²⁸⁹ Trust Group Hearing Information on Activities of the Counter Terrorism Center under the State Security Service of Georgia, available at: <https://parliament.ge/en/media/news/ndobis-jgufis-skhdomaze-kontteroristulisakmianobis-shesakheb-informatsia-moismines>, updated: 17.12.2024.

As mentioned, there were changes in the Defence and Security Committee. Since the former Chairperson, Beraia, was one of the 5 members of the Trust Group, after his departure, his place was taken by his successor. Furthermore, the majority quota was later filled by the nomination of Tengiz Sharmanashvili from the “Georgian Dream”.²⁹⁰ Therefore, in 2024, the Trust Group did not face any issues regarding quorum.

6.7.2.2. Mandate

The Trust Group, within its scope of authority, exercises oversight over the defence and security sectors. For this purpose, it is provided information on planned, performed and current secret state procurement,²⁹¹ a secret normative act containing main goals of the structure of the agency and the structural units of the agency,²⁹² once a year, not later than 15 April, relevant agencies submit to the Group a report on secret activities performed and special programmes implemented in the previous year, whereas, the OTA submits a statistical and generalised report on activities performed,²⁹³ in addition, the Group is entitled to inspect of the Operative-Technical Agency not more than twice a year,²⁹⁴ to visit relevant agencies by the consent of the Chairperson,²⁹⁵ to request information from relevant agencies,²⁹⁶ to summon the authorities to their sittings.²⁹⁷ If any elements of offence are detected during the exercise of the above-mentioned powers, the Trust Group is obliged to apply to the investigation authority and to attach available materials at its disposal.²⁹⁸

6.7.2.3. Obligation to Provide Information

The relevant agencies shall deliver detailed information on planned secret state procurement.²⁹⁹ However, this obligation arises if the estimated cost of goods or services exceeds GEL 2 000 000, and the estimated cost of construction work to be procured - GEL 4 000 000.³⁰⁰

During the 2023 Spring Session, the following accountable agencies presented information on planned secret state procurement to the Trust Group of the Parliament, as follows: the Ministry of Defence – 13 times, a State Sub-Agency operating in the field of Governance of the Ministry of Justice of Georgia – the Special Penitentiary Service, the Intelligence Service of Georgia, and the State Security Service of Georgia – once each.³⁰¹

During the 2023 Fall Session, the Ministry of Defence of Georgia presented information to the Trust Group 5 times in total: on 4 October, 1 November and 6, 7, 22 December 2023.³⁰²

During the 2024 Spring Session, the Ministry of Defence presented information 7 times in total, while the Special State Protection Service, the Operative-Technical Agency and the State Security Service each presented information once.³⁰³

²⁹⁰ The Letter of 18 April 2024 of the Faction “Georgian Dream” to the Parliament Bureau, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/360609?>, updated: 17.12.2024.

²⁹¹ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 159(5).

²⁹² *ibid*, Article 159(7).

²⁹³ *ibid*, Article 159(9).

²⁹⁴ *ibid*, Article 159(12).

²⁹⁵ *ibid*, Article 159(11).

²⁹⁶ *ibid*, Article 159(2).

²⁹⁷ *ibid*, Article 159(10).

²⁹⁸ *ibid*, Article 159(13).

²⁹⁹ *ibid*, Article 159(5).

³⁰⁰ *ibid*.

³⁰¹ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

³⁰² The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

³⁰³ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

6.7.2.4. Obligation to Present Secret Normative Act

The Prime Minister of Georgia, the Government of Georgia, and a relevant agency is obliged to introduce to the Trust Group with a secret normative act containing main goals of the structure of the agency and the structural units of the agency, within two weeks after the entry of the act into the secret part of the State Registry of Normative Acts.³⁰⁴ After the normative act is introduced to the Group, it shall be immediately returned to the relevant agency.³⁰⁵

During the reporting period, in accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the Intelligence Service of Georgia presented to the Trust Group the secret normative act containing the main goals of the structure and its structural units within the timeframe established by the Rules of Procedure.³⁰⁶

6.7.2.5. Presenting Report on the Performed Activities to the Group

Once a year, not later than 15 April, relevant agencies shall submit to the Trust Group a report on secret activities performed and special programmes implemented in the previous year.³⁰⁷ There are different requirements prescribed for the Operative-Technical Agency. It submits a statistical and generalised report on activities performed.³⁰⁸

In 2023, this obligation was fulfilled by the following agencies: the Intelligence Service of Georgia (9 February), the Special State Protection Service (14 February), the Ministry of Defence of Georgia (27 March), the State Security Service of Georgia (6 April), the Ministry of Internal Affairs (12 April), the State Sub-Agency operating in the field of Governance of the Ministry of Justice of Georgia – the Special Penitentiary Service (12 April). In addition, the LEPL Operative-Technical Agency presented a a statistical and generalized report on activities performed on 11 April 2023.³⁰⁹

6.7.2.6. Monitoring Visits

The Trust Group is authorised to visit relevant agencies.³¹⁰ For this, it requires the consent of the Chairperson.³¹¹ During the visit, members of the Trust Group are entitled to interview employees and get familiar with information related to issues falling under the jurisdiction of the Trust Group.³¹² It is noteworthy that prior to the visit, a decision of the Chairperson of the Trust Group is sent to a relevant agency.³¹³ The recommendation of the GYLA remains valid, and it is important to allow the group to conduct visits to agencies without prior notification.

The Trust Group is also entitled to inspect the Operative-Technical Agency.³¹⁴ However, compared to other agencies, its inspection can take place not more than twice a year.³¹⁵ In ad-

³⁰⁴ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 159(7).

³⁰⁵ *ibid.*

³⁰⁶ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023. The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

³⁰⁷ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 159(9).

³⁰⁸ *ibid.*

³⁰⁹ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

³¹⁰ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 159(11).

³¹¹ *ibid.*

³¹² *ibid.*

³¹³ *ibid.*

³¹⁴ *ibid.*, Article 159(12).

³¹⁵ *ibid.*

dition, the Trust Group itself selects a member/members who will inspect the Agency.³¹⁶

During the 2023 Spring Session, the members of the Trust Group conducted 6 visits to the following agencies: the subdivisions of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Georgia located along the administrative boundary line (2 visits), Besik Kutatelidze Mountain Training School of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia, the Training Center of the Special State Protection Service (SSPS), Giorgi Antsukhelidze Sergeant Academy of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia, and Major Gela Chedia Special Operations Training Center of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia.³¹⁷

During the 2023 Fall Session, the members of the Trust Group conducted four visits to the following agencies: the construction of the “Military City” near Mt. Makhata; a demonstration event held at the Vaziani shooting base; the base of the Special Operations Command of the Georgian Defence Forces (Mukhrovani); LEPL Operative-Technical Agency.³¹⁸

During the 2024 Spring Session, on 3 June 2023, the Chairperson of the Trust Group, Aleksandre Tabatadze, and the member of the Trust Group, Anri Okhanashvili, visited the military base of the I Infantry Brigade of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia located in the city of Gori.³¹⁹

6.7.2.7. Requesting Information

Relevant agencies are obliged, upon request by the Trust Group, to submit all information necessary for the Trust Group to exercise powers in a non-delayed manner, except for the cases provided for by the legislation of Georgia.³²⁰ The request for information from the Operative-Technical Agency has one condition. It only submits a statistical and generalised report on activities performed to the Group.³²¹ If the relevant agencies refuse to provide information, they are obliged to deliver substantiated refusal to the Trust Group in the written form.³²²

During the 2024 Spring Session, on 27 June, the Trust Group requested information from the Ministry of Internal Affairs, the Ministry of Defence and the Ministry of Justice, as well as the Intelligence Service and the Operative-Technical Agency.³²³ During the reporting period, the Trust Group did not exercise this authority in other sessions.

6.7.2.8. Summoning an Official to a Sitting

The chairpersons of relevant agencies, or if agreed with the trust group, persons authorized thereby, shall be entitled to attend sessions of the Trust Group, answer questions, and submit appropriate materials and reports on performed activities.³²⁴ However, upon the request of the Trust Group, they have the obligation to perform the mentioned activities.³²⁵

During the 2023 Spring Session, the Trust Group conducted 8 sittings. On these sessions, the following officials from the defence and security sector agencies attended: 1. 9 February

³¹⁶ *ibid.*

³¹⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

³¹⁸ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

³¹⁹ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

³²⁰ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 159(2).

³²¹ *ibid.*

³²² *ibid.*, Article 159(4).

³²³ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

³²⁴ The Rules of Procedure of the Parliament, Article 159(10).

³²⁵ *ibid.*

2023. The session was attended by the Head of the Intelligence Service of Georgia, Shalva Lomidze, and his first Deputy Giorgi Liluashvili; 2. 14 February 2023. The session was attended the Head of the Special State Protection Service, Anzor Chubinidze, and the Deputy Head of the Economic Department of the Special State Protection Service; 3. 27 March 2023. The Minister of Defence, Juansher Burchuladze, the Deputy Ministers of the Defence – Grigol Giorgadze and Giorgi Khaindrava, the Chief of the Georgian Defence Forces, the Deputy Chief of the Georgian Defence Forces and the Chief of the Georgian Defence Forces; 4. 6 April 2023. The Head of the State Security Service of Georgia, Grigol Liluashvili, and his First Deputy Aleksi Batiashvili, the Head of Information-Analytical Department of the State Security Service, and the Head of Counterintelligence Department of the State Security Service; 5. 12 April 2023 (Session 1). The Deputy Ministers of the Internal Affairs, Aleksandre Darakhvelidze and Giorgi Butkhuzi; 6. 12 April 2023 (Session 2). The Deputy Minister of Justice, Tornike Cheishvili, the General Director of the State Sub-Agency operating in the field of Governance of the Ministry of Justice of Georgia – the Special Penitentiary Service, Nika Tskhvariashvili; 7. 8 June 2023. The Head of the Intelligence Service of Georgia, Shalva Lomidze, and his first Deputy Giorgi Liluashvili, the Head of Analytical Department; 8. 19 June 2023. The Deputy Minister of Defence, Grigol Giorgadze, the Chief of the Georgian Defence Forces, the Major General and the Chief of Operational Planning Department of the Georgian Defence Forces, Brigadier General.³²⁶

During the 2023 Spring Session 6 sittings took place. On these sessions, the following of officials from the defence and security sector agencies attended: 1. 29 September 2023. The session was attended by the Head of the Intelligence Service of Georgia, Shalva Lomidze, and his first Deputy Giorgi Liluashvili, the Head of Analytical Department; 2. 29 September 2023. The session was attended by the Deputy Minister of the Defence, Giorgi Khaindrava, and the Deputy Chief of the Georgian Defence Forces; 3. 13 October 2023. The session was attended by the Deputy Minister of the Defence, Giorgi Khaindrava, and the Head of the Procurement Department of the Ministry of Defence of Georgia, the Deputy Head of the State Security Service of Georgia, Aleksi Batiashvili, the Head of Information-Analytical Department of the State Security Service, and the Head of the Main Division of the Economic Department of the State Security Service, the Deputy Head of the Intelligence Service of Georgia, Giorgi Liluashvili, and the Head of the Financial Division of the Intelligence Service, the Head of the Special State Protection Service of Georgia, Anzor Chubinidze, and the Deputy Head of the Economic Department of the the Special State Protection Service of Georgia, the Deputy Minister of the Internal Affairs of Georgia, Aleksandre Darakhvelidze, and the Head of Economic Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs, the Deputy Minister of Justice, Tornike Cheishvili, the General Director of the State Sub-Agency operating in the field of Governance of the Ministry of Justice of Georgia – the Special Penitentiary Service, Nika Tskhvariashvili, and the Head of the Economic Department of the Special Penitentiary Service; 4. 14 December 2023. The session was attended by the Deputy Head of the State Security Service of Georgia, Aleksi Batiashvili, and the Head of Information-Analytical Department of the State Security Service, Giorgi Sabedashvili; 5. 14 December 2023. The Deputy Head of the State Security Service of Georgia, Aleksi Batiashvili, and the Head of Counterintelligence Department of the State Security Service; 6. 26 December 2023. The session was attended by the Deputy Head of the State Security Service of Georgia, Levan Akhobadze, and the Deputy Head of the Counterterrorism Center of the State Security Service.³²⁷

During the 2024 Spring Session, the Trust Group conducted 4 sittings on two different dates.³²⁸ Two sittings took place on 6 March 2024.³²⁹ The first session of this day was at-

³²⁶ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

³²⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

³²⁸ The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

³²⁹ *ibid.*

tended by by the Head of the Intelligence Service of Georgia, Shalva Lomidze, and his first Deputy Giorgi Liluashvili, and the Head of Analytical Department of the Intelligence Service.³³⁰ The second session held on the same day was attended by the Deputy Minister of Justice, Tornike Cheishvili, the General Director of the State Sub-Agency operating in the field of Governance of the Ministry of Justice of Georgia – the Special Penitentiary Service.³³¹ The remaining two sessions took place on 28 March 2024.³³² In this case as well, two sessions were held, with the first one attended by the Head of the Special State Protection Service of Georgia, Anzor Chubinidze, and the Head of the Economic Department of the Special State Protection Service of Georgia, while the other one was attended by the Head of the State Security Service of Georgia, Grigol Liluashvili, and the First Deputy of the State Security Service, Aleksi Batiashvili, the Head of the Counterterrorism Center of the State Security Service, and the Head of Counterintelligence Department of the State Security Service.³³³

During the 2024 Fall Session, the Trust Group did not conduct any meetings.

³³⁰ *ibid.*

³³¹ *ibid.*

³³² *ibid.*

³³³ *ibid.*

VII. RECOMMENDATIONS

Considering the theoretical and practical analysis of parliamentary oversight mechanisms, GYLA has developed recommendations. It is important that the recommendations listed below, along with those presented in the first part of the research, be considered together in order to present a unified perspective on the overall activities of the 10th Convocation of the Parliament:

- It is essential for the Prime Minister's annual report to coincide with the anniversary of the motion of confidence;
- It is recommended that the opposition use the platform of the Prime Minister's annual report to ensure the accountability of the head of government before Parliament;
- It is essential that in an election year, the implementation of oversight mechanisms is planned in such a way that the assessment of the activities of all accountable Ministers is possible before the elections;
- MPs shall actively use the mechanism of Ministerial Hour mechanism and attend it;
- It is recommended that the Minister is not given additional time to discuss other ongoing developments in the format of the Ministerial Hour;
- For the purposes of oversight, it is important that MPs focus on thematic questions rather than "supporting" the accountable person;
- It is recommended to exclude the possibility of asking different questions under one interpellation;
- Legislators must ensure that the procedure is structured in a way that allows the interpellation to proceed comprehensively;
- It is recommended that the Q&A session of the interpellation refers to the content of the questions sent in a format of interpellation;
- It is important that only the questions raised in the interpellation be discussed within this format, and that the speaker does not diverge from them;
- It is recommended that the parliamentary majority refrain from procedural tricks that may hinder the opposition's proper exercise of their rights (in the context of establishing a temporary investigative commission);
- The directions in the Action Plans of Committees should be equally allocated among the committee members;
- It is recommended to reflect the changes in the members of the Committee into the Action Plan. It is important when MPs leave a committee or the Parliament, the issues they were responsible for be reassigned to the remaining or newly joined members of the committee. The Rules of Procedure should include a provision that obligates the committee to allocate issues taken on by the departing member to others in a reasonable timeframe shortly after the shift;
- It is essential that a thematic rapporteur is appointed solely as a natural person, with their name and surname specified, rather than a legal entity or a subject referred to by general terms;

- It is recommended that rapporteurs properly fulfil their obligations and present the relevant reports to the committees;
- The principle of proportional representation of factions shall be applied when forming thematic inquiry groups;
- It is recommended that when starting thematic research, the group members should be members of the founding subject;
- It is recommended that the Rules of Procedure outline the possibility to determine the term of authority of a group in each specific case taking into account the specifics of the issue;
- It is essential to develop a recommendation and send it to relevant addressees. Otherwise, the work of a Thematic Inquiry Group would be like an academic activity, which does not serve the purposes of parliamentary oversight;
- It is recommended that members of parliament not be appointed to leadership positions in agencies they previously conducted oversight in their role as MPs.

ANNEXES

Table №1. The Practice of Appointing Thematic Rapporteur at the Parliament of Georgia (2023)

Committees	Identification of the Thematic Rapporteur	Name and Surname of the Committee Member	Representative of the Opposition	Reference "Member of Committee"	Friendship Group	Temporary Commission	Delegation	Committee	Working Group	Staff of the Committee
Agrarian Issues Committee ³³⁴		✓ ³³⁵	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Human Rights and Civil Integration Committee ³³⁶		✓ ³³⁷	✓ ³³⁸	✓ ³³⁹	-	-	-	-	-	-
Education and Science Committee ³⁴⁰		✓ ³⁴¹	✓ ³⁴²	✓ ³⁴³	-	-	-	-	-	-
Environmental Protection and Natural Resources Committee ³⁴⁴		✓ ³⁴⁵	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

³³⁴ The Action Plan of the Agrarian Issues Committee outlines 4 Goals and 51 Objectives. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/agraruli/samoqmedo-gegma-2023.pdf>, updated: 26.12.2023.

³³⁵ The 51 Objectives prescribed by the Action Plan of the Agrarian Issues Committee are allocated among following MPs: Nino Tsilosani (Chairperson) – 41 Issues, Gela Samkharauli (First Deputy) – 14 Issues, Shalva Kereselidze – 5 Issues, Zaal Dugladze – 1 Issue, Samvel Manukyan- 3 Issues, Goderdzi Chankseliani - 3 Issues, Sumbat Kyuregyan - 2 Issues, Sozar Subari - 6 Issues, Giorgi Tsagareishvili - 1 Issue.

³³⁶ The Action Plan of the Human Rights and Civil Integration Committee outlines 14 Goals and 56 Objectives. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/adamianis-uflebebi/samoqmedo-gegma/samoqmedo-gegma-adamiani-2023.pdf>, updated: 26.12.2023.

³³⁷ The Chairperson of the Committee, Mikheil Sarjeladze is rapporteur for 46 Issues, while his First Deputy Aluda Ghudushauri – for 33 Issues, Savalan Mirzoev - 6, Vladimir Chachibala - 6 (Vladimir Chachibala is not an MP since 24 March 2023), Davit Sergeenko - 6 (Davit Sergeenko is not an MP since 16 November 2023), Zaur Dargali - 4 Issues.

³³⁸ The Rapporteurs from the Opposition are, as follows: Ana Buchukuri – 18 Issues, Ana Natsvlishvili - 31, Tariel Nakaidze - 12.

³³⁹ For the 11 Issues prescribed by the Action Plan, the Thematic Rapporteurs are the members of the Committee.

³⁴⁰ The Action Plan of the Education and Science Committee outlines 4 Directions, 4 Strategic Goals, 13 Objectives and 67 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/ganateba/samoqm-gegma/ganateba-samoqmedo-gegma-2023.pdf>, updated: 26.12.2023.

³⁴¹ The Chairperson of the Committee, Givi Mikanadze is rapporteur for 30 Issues, while his First Deputy Giorgi Chakvetadze – for 10. From the remaining members, rapporteurs are, as follows: Mariam Lashkhi - 13 Issues, Vladimir Kakhadze - 3 Issues, Baia Kvitsiani - 17 Issues, Genrieta Tsitsava – 1 Issue.

³⁴² The Rapporteurs from the Opposition are, as follows: Rostom Chkheidze – 2 Issues, and David Ziplimiani – 1 Issue.

³⁴³ According to the action plan, "all members" are the rapporteurs on 12 Issues.

³⁴⁴ The Action Plan of the Environmental Protection and Natural Resources Committee outlines 3 Main Directions, 13 Strategic Goals and 78 Objectives. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/garemo-samoqmedo-gegma-ge-2023.pdf>, updated: 26.12.2023.

³⁴⁵ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Maia Bitadze (Chairperson) – 78 Issues, Khatia Tsilosani (First Deputy) – 38 Issues, Nodar Turdzeladze - 2 Issues, Aleksandre Dalakishvili – 39 Issues, Giorgi Tsagareishvili – 32 Issues.

Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee ³⁴⁶	✓ ³⁴⁷	✓ ³⁴⁸	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Diaspora and Caucasus Issues Committee ³⁴⁹	✓ ³⁵⁰	✓ ³⁵¹	✓ ³⁵²	-	-	-	-	-	✓ ³⁵³
Committee on European Integration ³⁵⁴	✓ ³⁵⁵	✓ ³⁵⁶	-	-	-	-	-	-	✓ ³⁵⁷
Defence and Security Committee ³⁵⁸	✓ ³⁵⁹	✓ ³⁶⁰	✓ ³⁶¹	-	-	-	-	-	✓ ³⁶²

³⁴⁶ The Action Plan of the Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee outlines 3 Strategic Goals, 10 Objectives and 109 Issues. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/dargobrivi/kom-samoq-gegma-2023.pdf>, updated: 26.12.2023.

³⁴⁷ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Davit Songhulashvili (Chairperson) – 98 Issues, Eka Sepashvili (First Deputy) – 58 Issues, Isko Daseni – 1 Issue, Nino Tsilosani – 20 Issues (Nino Tsilosani left the Committee on 30 May 2023), Gocha Enukidze – 10 Issues, Elguja Gotsiridze – 2 Issues, Levan Mgaloblishvili – 7 Issues, Vasil Chigogidze – 3 Issues, Bezhan Tsakadze – 4 Issues.

³⁴⁸ The Rapporteurs from the Opposition are, as follows: Beka Liliashvili – 7 Issues (Beka Liliashvili left the Committee on 4 May 2023), Khatuna Samnidze – 2 Issues.

³⁴⁹ The Action Plan of the Diaspora and Caucasus Issues Committee outlines 8 Goals and 51 Issues. The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

³⁵⁰ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Beka Odisharia (Chairperson) – 48 Issues, Givi Chichinadze (First Deputy) – 41 Issues, Nodar Turdzeladze – 38 Issues, Irakli Medzmariashvili – 9 Issues, Ketevan Dumbadze – 12 Issues. Ketevan Dumbadze left the Parliament on 5 September 2023. The information is available at: <https://parliament.ge/parliament-members/7135/activity>, updated: 26.03.2024.

³⁵¹ The Rapporteur from the Opposition is Fridon Injia.

³⁵² Term “Committee Member” is used in 3 cases.

³⁵³ Members from the Committee Staff have been appointed as Rapporteurs on all issues.

³⁵⁴ The Action Plan of the Committee on European Integration outlines 4 Strategic Goals, 7 Objectives and 60 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/evointegracia/samoq-gegma-2023.pdf>, updated: 26.12.2023.

³⁵⁵ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Maka Bochorishvili (Chairperson) – 35 Issues, Leval Karumidze (First Deputy) – 4 Issues, Khatia Tsilosani – 6 Issues (Khatia Tsilosani left the Committee on 24 April 2023), Davit Songhulashvili – 11 Issues, Nino Iobashvili – 2 Issues (Nino Iobashvili left the Parliament on 24 March 2023), Archil Talakvadze – 6 Issues, Viktor Sanikidze – 4 Issues, Nikoloz Samkharadze – 1 Issue, Maia Menagharishvili – 1 Issue (Maia Menagharishvili left the Parliament on 16 May 2023).

³⁵⁶ The Rapporteur from the Opposition on 2 Issues is Teona Akubardia.

³⁵⁷ Members from the Committee Staff have been appointed as Rapporteurs on all issues.

³⁵⁸ The Action Plan of the Defence and Security Committee outlines 5 Directions and 64 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/tavdacva/samoq-gegma-2023.pdf>, updated: 27.12.2023.

³⁵⁹ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Irakli Beraia (Chairperson) – 28 Issues, Aleksandre Tabatadze (First Deputy) – 16 Issues, Vladimir Chachibaia – 23 Issues (Vladimir Chachibaia left the Parliament on 24 March 2023), Irakli Chikovani – 2 Issues, Giorgi Khelashvili – 8 Issues (Giorgi Khelashvili left the Parliament on 24 March 2023).

³⁶⁰ The Rapporteur from the Opposition on 5 Issues is Teona Akubardia.

³⁶¹ Term “Committee Member” is used in 54 cases.

³⁶² For each issue, a responsible person has been designated from the Staff of the Committee.

Legal Issues Committee ³⁶³	✓ ³⁶⁴	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Culture Committee ³⁶⁵	✓ ³⁶⁶	✓ ³⁶⁷	-	-	-	-	-	-	✓ ³⁶⁸
Regional Policy and Self-Government Committee ³⁶⁹	✓ ³⁷⁰	✓ ³⁷¹	-	-	-	-	-	-	✓ ³⁷²
Foreign Relations Committee ³⁷³	-	✓ ³⁷⁴	✓ ³⁷⁵	-	✓ ³⁷⁶	✓ ³⁷⁷	-	-	-

³⁶³ The Action Plan of the Legal Issues Committee outlines 5 Strategic Goals, 8 Objectives and 49 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/komitetebi/iuriduli/samoqmedo-2023.pdf>, updated: 27.12.2023.

³⁶⁴ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Anri Okhanashvili (Chairperson) – 39 Issues, Davit Matikashvili (First Deputy) – 20 Issues, Rati Ionatamishvili – 5 Issues, Aluda Ghudushauri – 11 Issues, Aleksandre Tabatadze - 6 Issues, Nino Iobashvili – 7 Issues, Mikheil Sarjveladze – 10 Issues, Giorgi Amilakhvari – 4 Issues (Giorgi Amilakhvari left the Parliament on 24 March 2023), Guram Macharashvili – 12 Issues, Irakli Shatakishvili - 6 Issues.

³⁶⁵ The Action Plan of the Culture Committee outlines 4 Strategic Goals, 15 Objectives and 60 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/komitetebi/kultura/samoqmedo-gegma-2023-kultura.pdf>, updated: 27.12.2023.

³⁶⁶ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Eliso Bolkvadze (Chairperson) – 52 Issues, Irakli Mezurnishvili (First Deputy) - 20 Issues, Ketevan Dumbadze - 14 Issues (Ketevan Dumbadze left the Parliament on 5 September 2023), Givi Chichinadze – 7 Issues, Beka Odisharia - 6 Issues, Davit Matikashvili – 11 Issues (Davit Matikashvili left the Committee on 19 April 2023), Baia Kvitsiani - 12 Issues.

³⁶⁷ The Rapporteur from the Opposition are, as follows: Rostom Chkheidze – 3 Issues (Rostom Chkheidze left the Committee on 22 May 2023), Grigol Vashadze – 4 Issues, Aleksandre Elisashvili – 3 Issues (Aleksandre Elisashvili left the Committee on 1 May 2023).

³⁶⁸ Responsible persons for each issue have also been appointed from the Staff Committee.

³⁶⁹ The Action Plan of the Regional Policy and Self-Government Committee outlines 4 Strategic Goals and 33 Activities. The Action Plan is available: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/komitetebi/regionuli/samoqmedo-gegma-2023.pdf>, updated: 27.12.2023.

³⁷⁰ The Thematic Rapporteur is Kakha Kakhishvili (Chairperson) – 8 Issues.

³⁷¹ Term “Committee” is used in 25 cases.

³⁷² Responsible persons for each issue have also been appointed from the Staff Committee.

³⁷³ The Action Plan of the Foreign Relations Committee outlines 5 Strategic Goals, 17 Objectives and 62 Activities. The Information Provided by the Letter N1908/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 18 March 2024.

³⁷⁴ The Action Plan of the Committee does not outline the names and surnames of the Rapporteurs. With general indication, the Committee Chairperson and members are the rapporteurs for 52 issues, Committee Members for 1 issue, and the Committee Chairperson for 7 issues.

³⁷⁵ The Friendship Group with the United Kingdom is the Rapporteur for 1 issue.

³⁷⁶ The Heads of the Standing Parliamentary delegation are the Rapporteurs for 1 issue, while the Heads of the respective delegations are the Rapporteurs for 1 issue.

³⁷⁷ The Committees on Defence and Security, Human Rights, and Legal Issues are the rapporteurs for one issue each.

Procedural Issues and Rules Committee ³⁷⁸	✓ ³⁷⁹	✓ ³⁸⁰	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Budget and Finance Committee ³⁸¹	✓ ³⁸²	✓ ³⁸³	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Sport and Youth Affairs Committee ³⁸⁴	✓ ³⁸⁵	✓ ³⁸⁶	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Healthcare and Social Issues Committee ³⁸⁷	✓ ³⁸⁸	✓ ³⁸⁹	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

³⁷⁸ The Action Plan of the Procedural Issues and Rules Committee outlines 3 Directions and 38 Issues. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/saproceduro/samoqm-gagma-2023.pdf>, updated: 09.01.2024.

³⁷⁹ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Irakli Kadagishvili (Chairperson) – 38 Issues, Irakli Shatakishvili (First Deputy) – 23 Issues, Giorgi Kakhiani – 19 Issues, Genrieta Tsitsava - 19 Issues, Irma Zavradasvili - 1 Issue (Irma Zavradasvili left the Committee on 24 April 2023), Guram Macharashvili - 15 Issues.

³⁸⁰ The Rapporteurs from the Opposition are, as follows: Paata Manjgaladze - 3 Issues, Tamar Kordzaia – 3 Issues, Levan Bezhashvili - 2 Issues, Bachuki Kardava - 2 Issues (Bachuki Kardava left the Committee on 22 May 2023).

³⁸¹ The Action Plan of the Budget and Finance Committee outlines 13 Directions. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/sapinanso/samoqm-gagma/safinanso-tematuri-momxsneblebi-2023.pdf>, updated: 09.01.2024.

³⁸² The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Irakli Kovzanadze (Chairperson) – 4 Directions, Gogi Meshveliani (First Deputy) – 4 Directions, Paata Kvizhandze - 2 Directions, Irakli Zarkua - 3 Directions, Ramina Beradze - 2 Directions, Bezhan Tsakadze - 3 Directions, Anton Obolashvili - 2 Directions, Zaal Mikeladze - 1.

³⁸³ The Rapporteur from the Opposition are, as follows: Roman Gotsiridze – 1 Direction, Aleksandre Rakviashvili - 3 Directions, Beka Liluashvili – 5 Directions.

³⁸⁴ The Action Plan of the Sport and Youth Affairs Committee outlines 4 Directions, 10 Objectives and 65 Activities.

³⁸⁵ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Irakli Medzmarishvili (Chairperson) – 62 Issues, Viktor Sanikidze (First Deputy) – 35 Issues, Davit Kacharava – 57 Issues, Zaza Lominadze - 7 Issues, Manuchar Kurkvelia – 34 Issues, Irakli (Dachi) Beraia – 1 Issue, Shota Khabareli – 3 Issues, Givi Mikanadze – 29 Issues, Mikheil Kavelashvili - 3 Issues.

³⁸⁶ The Thematic Rapporteur from the Opposition is Iago Khvichia – 1 Issue.

³⁸⁷ The Action Plan of the Healthcare and Social Issues Committee outlines 4 Strategic Objectives and 39 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/jandacva/sam-gagma/jandacva-samoqmedo-gagma-2023.pdf>, updated: 09.01.2024.

³⁸⁸ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Zaza Lominadze (Chairperson) – 35 Issues, Vladimir Kakhadze (First Deputy) – 10 Issues, Davit Sergeenko - 2 Issues (Davit Sergeenko left the Parliament on 16 November 2023), Ramina Beradze - 6 Issues, Zaal Mikeladze - 5 Issues, Irma Zavradasvili - 6 Issues, Dimitri Khundadze – 5 Issues.

³⁸⁹ The Rapporteur from the Opposition are, as follows: Giorgi Godabrelidze - 4 Issues, Vakhtang Megrelishvili - 1 Issue.

Table №2. The Term of Authority of the Thematic Inquiry Group

The Creating Subject	The Name of the Thematic Inquiry Group	The Date of its Creation	Report of the Opinion			The Opinion has not been presented
			Within 3 months	Within additional 2 months	In a violation of the deadline	
Education and Science Committee	The impact of the condition of infrastructure and human resources in early and pre-school education institutions on the delivery of quality education	23 June 2023			☒ ³⁹⁰	
	Assessing the impact of students' social and emotional conditions on academic achievements and the effectiveness of existing support mechanisms	26 June 2023			☒ ³⁹¹	
	The practice of adhering to sanitary-hygienic standards and school doctor regulations in educational institutions and existing challenges	26 June 2023			☒ ³⁹²	
	Identifying the challenges faced by public higher educational institutions in Georgia's regions and developing support mechanisms	25 June 2023			☒ ³⁹³	
	Identifying priorities in vocational education that align with the labour market and analysing the funding model	23 June 2023			☒ ³⁹⁴	

³⁹⁰ On 24 November 2023, the Chairperson of the Committee informed the Bureau that the Thematic Inquiry Group decided on the extension of the term. However, the Letter does not outline for how long the term was extended. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/347437?>, updated: 15.01.2024. During the Committee Sitting of 1 February 2024, the Opinion of the Thematic Inquiry Group was heard. Session Minutes, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/358029?>, updated: 10.04.2024.

³⁹¹ On 24 November 2023, the Chairperson of the Committee informed the Bureau that the Thematic Inquiry Group decided on the extension of the term. However, the Letter does not outline for how long the term was extended. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/347437?>, updated: 15.01.2024. On 15 March 2024, the Committee informed the Bureau about the completion of work by the Thematic Inquiry Group and the adoption of its Opinion, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/358214?>, updated: 10.04.2024.

³⁹² On 24 November 2023, the Chairperson of the Committee informed the Bureau that the Thematic Inquiry Group decided on the extension of the term. However, the Letter does not outline for how long the term was extended. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/347437?>, updated: 15.01.2024. On 15 March 2024, the Committee informed the Bureau about the completion of work by the Thematic Inquiry Group and the adoption of its Opinion, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/358214?>, updated: 10.04.2024.

³⁹³ On 24 November 2023, the Chairperson of the Committee informed the Bureau that the Thematic Inquiry Group decided on the extension of the term. However, the Letter does not outline for how long the term was extended. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/347437?>, updated: 15.01.2024. On 28 December 2023, the Committee informed the Bureau about the completion of work by the Thematic Inquiry Group and the adoption of its Opinion, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/353613?>, updated: 10.04.2024.

³⁹⁴ On 24 November 2023, the Chairperson of the Committee informed the Bureau that the Thematic Inquiry Group decided on the extension of the term. However, the Letter does not outline for how long the term was extended. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/347437?>, updated: 15.01.2024. On 15 March 2024, the Committee informed the Bureau about the completion of work by the Thematic Inquiry Group and the adoption of its Opinion, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/358214?>, updated: 10.04.2024.

Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee	A thematic inquiry group on the legislative framework for the development of innovation-promoting instruments	1 May 2023	☒ ³⁹⁵		
Diaspora and Caucasus Issues Committee	Involvement of the Diaspora in Georgia's development: attracting sustainable capital from the diaspora	16 May 2023			☒ ³⁹⁶
Sports and Youth Affairs Committee	The prevention and rehabilitation policy regarding adolescents and youth's attitudes toward lotteries, gambling, and betting games, the challenges, and potential solutions	6 June 2023		☒ ³⁹⁷	
Healthcare and Social Issues Committee	The accessibility of mental health services in Georgia and the existing challenges	21 June 2023	☒ ³⁹⁸		
Agrarian Issues Committee	Accessibility to finance in the agricultural sector (within the context of private financial institutions)	10 October 2023	☒ ³⁹⁹		
Education, Science and Youth Affairs Committee	The school community involvement in the managing process of general education institutions	16 October 2023		☒ ⁴⁰⁰	

not outline for how long the term was extended. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/347437?>, updated: 15.01.2024. On 15 March 2024, the Committee informed the Bureau about the completion of work by the Thematic Inquiry Group and the adoption of its Opinion, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/358214?>, updated: 10.04.2024.

³⁹⁵ The Thematic Inquiry Group once again extended the term of authority, which was notified to the Bureau. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/338893?>, updated: 15.01.2024. On 1 December 2023, the Thematic Inquiry Group presented the Opinion, available at: <https://parliament.ge/print/news/dargobrivi-ekonomikisa-da-ekonomikuri-politikis-komitetma-tematuri-moklevis-shedegebis-shesakheb-informatsia-moismina>, updated: 15.01.2024. The Opinion of the Thematic Inquiry Group, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/tematuri-moklevis-dargobrivi-inovaciebi/daskvna-inovaciebi.pdf>, updated: 15.01.2024.

³⁹⁶ The Thematic Inquiry Group extended the term twice, which was notified to the Bureau. For the first time, the term of authority was extended for 2 months, and for the second time – for a month. Relevant documents are available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/337616?>, <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/338893?>, updated: 15.01.2024.

³⁹⁷ The Thematic Inquiry Group was scheduled to complete its work by 6 September 2023, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/331279?>, updated: 15.01.2024. However, the Group decided to extend its term of authority for 2 months. The Letter of 6 November 2023, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/344646?>, updated: 15.01.2024. During the 26 February 2024, the Committee heard the Opinion of the Thematic Inquiry Group. The Session Minutes N98 of the Education, Science and Youth Affairs Committee, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/359666?>, updated: 22.04.2024.

³⁹⁸ The Thematic Inquiry Group once again extended the term for 1 month, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/346883?>, updated: 15.01.2024. The Group presented its Opinion on 25 December 2023, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/353042?>, updated: 15.01.2024.

³⁹⁹ The Opinion was heard at the Committee on 19 February 2024. The Opinion is available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/356895?>, updated: 10.04.2024.

⁴⁰⁰ The Thematic Inquiry Group prepared the Opinion in a violation of the deadline, particularly, on 24 June 2024. The Opinion is available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/365579?>, updated: 18.09.2024.

Culture Committee	The inclusion of students with disabilities in the arts education institutions, both public and private	11 September 2023	☒ ⁴⁰¹	
Healthcare and Social Issues Committee	Accessibility to oncology services in Georgia and the existing challenges.	4 September 2023	☒ ⁴⁰²	
Education, Science and Youth Affairs Committee, Diaspora and Caucasus Issues Committee, and Culture Committee	The strengthening of the activities of Georgian weekend schools (including in the field of arts education) abroad, as well as strengthening the activities of ensembles	20 March 2024		☒ ⁴⁰³
Regional Policy and Self-Government Committee	the role of decentralization and the challenges for ensuring equal socio-economic development of municipalities	4 March 2024		☒ ⁴⁰⁴

⁴⁰¹ The Thematic Inquiry Group decided to extend the term of authority for 1 month, which was notified to the Bureau on 11 December 2023, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/350555?>, updated: 10.04.2024. The Thematic Inquiry Group again decided to extend the term of authority for 1 month, which was notified to the Bureau on 4 March 2024, available at: <https://info.parliament.ge/file/1/BillReviewContent/357184?>, updated: 10.04.2024. The Opinion of the Thematic Inquiry Group is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/tematuri-mokvleva/kultura/inkluzia/tematuri-daskvna.pdf>, updated: 18.09.2024.

⁴⁰² The Thematic Inquiry Group presented the Opinion on 17 September 2024, information available at: <https://www.parliament.ge/en/media/news/parlamentshi-sakartveloshi-onkologur-servisebze-khelisatsvdomobis-taobaze-tematuri-mokvlevis-angarishis-prezentatsia-gaimarta>, updated: 18.09.2024. The Opinion is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/tematuri-mokvleva/jandacva/onkologia/angarishi-onkologia-min.pdf>, updated: 18.09.2024.

⁴⁰³ The Group was created for 3 months, however, on 13 June, its term was extended for two months. The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

⁴⁰⁴ The Group was created for 3 months, however, on 7 June, its term was extended for two months. The Information Provided by the Letter N5495/2-7/24 of the Parliament of Georgia, 16 August 2024.

Table №3. Members of the Thematic Inquiry Group

The Creating Subject	The Name of the Thematic Inquiry Group	Proportion of Members	The Proportionality of Non-Members of the Creating Subject in the Group	Main Rapporteur
Education and Science Committee	The impact of the condition of infrastructure and human resources in early and pre-school education institutions on the delivery of quality education	2 - Majority, 0 – Opposition ⁴⁰⁵	0	Giorgi Chakvetadze, Majority
	Assessing the impact of students' social and emotional conditions on academic achievements and the effectiveness of existing support mechanisms	3 - Majority, 0 – Opposition ⁴⁰⁶	0	Baia Kvitsiani, Majority
	The practice of adhering to sanitary-hygienic standards and school doctor regulations in educational institutions and existing challenges	4 - Majority, 0 – Opposition ⁴⁰⁷	1 ⁴⁰⁸	Vladimer Kakhadze, Majority
	Identifying the challenges faced by public higher educational institutions in Georgia's regions and developing support mechanisms	3 - Majority, 0 – Opposition ⁴⁰⁹	0	Givi Mikanadze, Majority
	Identifying priorities in vocational education that align with the labour market and analysing the funding model	2 - Majority, 0 – Opposition ⁴¹⁰	0	Mariam Lashkhi, Majority
Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee	A thematic inquiry group on the legislative framework for the development of innovation-promoting instruments	3 - Majority, 1 – Opposition ⁴¹¹	1 ⁴¹²	

⁴⁰⁵ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

⁴⁰⁶ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

⁴⁰⁷ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

⁴⁰⁸ Such a member was Irma Zavradasvili. The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023. See, also, the Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://parliament.ge/parliament-members/7103/activity>, updated: 17.01.2024.

⁴⁰⁹ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

⁴¹⁰ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

⁴¹¹ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

⁴¹² Beka Liliashvili was a Member of the Committee during the creation of the Group, however, he left the Committee after three days of its creation. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://parliament.ge/parliament-members/7134/activity>, updated: 17.01.2024.

Diaspora and Caucasus Issues Committee	Involvement of the Diaspora in Georgia's development: attracting sustainable capital from the diaspora	6 - Majority, 3 - Opposition ⁴¹³	2 ⁴¹⁴	Beka Odisharia, Majority
Sport and Youth Affairs Committee	The prevention and rehabilitation policy regarding adolescents and youth's attitudes toward lotteries, gambling, and betting games, the challenges, and potential solutions	3 - Majority, 0 - Opposition	1 ⁴¹⁵	Givi Mikanadze, Majority
Healthcare and Social Issues Committee	The accessibility of mental health services in Georgia and the existing challenges	4 - Majority, 2 - Opposition ⁴¹⁶	0	Ana Tsitlidze, Opposition
Agrarian Issues Committee	Accessibility to finance in the agricultural sector (within the context of private financial institutions)	2 - Majority, 2 - Opposition	2 ⁴¹⁷	Nino Tsilosani, Majority
Education, Science and Youth Affairs Committee	The school community involvement in the managing process of general education institutions	3 - Majority, 0 - Opposition	0	Ramona Beridze, Majority
Culture Committee	The inclusion of students with disabilities in the arts education institutions, both public and private	3 - Majority, 0 - Opposition	0	Eliso Bolkvadze, Majority
Healthcare and Social Issues Committee	Accessibility to oncology services in Georgia and the existing challenges.	6 - Majority, 2 - Opposition	0	Irma Zavrashvili, Majority
Education, Science and Youth Affairs Committee, Diaspora and Caucasus Issues Committee, and Culture Committee	The strengthening of the activities of Georgian weekend schools (including in the field of arts education) abroad, as well as strengthening the activities of ensembles	4 - Majority, 0 - Opposition	-	Givi Mikanadze, Majority
Regional Policy and Self-Government Committee	The role of decentralization and the challenges for ensuring equal socio-economic development of municipalities	9 - Majority, 1 - Opposition.	1 ⁴¹⁸	Merab Kvaraia, Majority

⁴¹³ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

⁴¹⁴ Ketevan Dumbadze left the Parliament on 5 September 2023. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://parliament.ge/parliament-members/7135/activity>, updated: 17.01.2024. Nika Machutadze left the Committee on 22 May 2023. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://parliament.ge/parliament-members/7085/activity>, updated: 17.01.2024.

⁴¹⁵ Eka Sepashvili was not a member of the Sports and Youth Affairs Committee. The Website of the Parliament of Georgia, available at: <https://parliament.ge/parliament-members/7097/activity>, updated: 17.01.2024.

⁴¹⁶ The Information Provided by the Letter N7010/2-7/23 of the Parliament of Georgia, 21 September 2023.

⁴¹⁷ Mikheil Daushvili and Aleksandre Rakviashvili were not the members of the Agrarian Committee.

⁴¹⁸ Zaza Lominadze was not a member of the Regional Policy and Self-Government Committee.

Table №4. The Practice of Appointing Thematic Rapporteur at the Parliament of Georgia (2024)

Committees	Identification of the Thematic Rapporteur	Name and Surname of the Committee Member	Representative of the Opposition	Reference "Member of Committee"	Friendship Group	Temporary Commission	Delegation	Committee	Working Group	Staff of the Committee
Agrarian Issues Committee ⁴¹⁹		✓ ⁴²⁰	✓ ⁴²¹	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Human Rights and Civil Integration Committee ⁴²²		✓ ⁴²³	✓ ⁴²⁴	✓ ⁴²⁵	-	-	-	-	-	-
Education and Science Committee ⁴²⁶		✓ ⁴²⁷	✓ ⁴²⁸	✓ ⁴²⁹	-	-	-	-	-	-
Environmental Protection and Natural Resources Committee ⁴³⁰		✓ ⁴³¹	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

⁴¹⁹ The Action Plan of the Agrarian Issues Committee outlines 4 Objectives and 51 Activities. The Action Plan is available at:

<https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/Agaruli/samoqmedo-gegma/Agaruli-samoqmedo-gegma-2024.pdf>, updated: 21.07.2024.

⁴²⁰ The Activities of the Agrarian Issues Committee are allocated with the following quantity among the following MPs: Gela Samkharauli (First Deputy) - 29 Issues, Zaal Dugladze - 1 Issue, Samvel Manukyan - 2 Issues, Goderdzi Chankasiani - 3 Issues, Sumbat Kyuregyan - 1 Issue, Sozar Subari - 4 Issues, Giorgi Tsagareishvili - 2 Issues. Giorgi Tsagareishvili left the Parliament on 26 June 2024, information available at: <https://www.parliament.ge/parliament-members/2038/activity>, updated: 21.07.2024. From Majority, also, Dachi Beraia is a rapporteur for 7 issues, Giorgi Sosiasvili - 1 Issue, Ketevan Charkviani - 3 Issues.

⁴²¹ The representative from the opposition is Shalva Kereselidze - 1 Issue.

⁴²² The Action Plan of the Human Rights and Civil Integration Committee outlines 13 Objectives and 64 Activities. The Action Plan is available at:

<https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/adamianis-uflebebi/samoqmedo-gegma/2024.pdf>, updated: 21.07.2024.

⁴²³ The Chairperson of the Committee, Mikheil Sajrveladze, is a rapporteur for 50 Issues. Mikheil Sarjveladze left the Parliament on 19 March 2024, available at: <https://parliament.ge/parliament-members/7105/activity>, updated: 21.07.2024. While his First Deputy, Aluda Ghudushauri - 3, Savalan Mirzoev - 6, Zaur Dargali - 2, Merab Kvarala - 5, Sumbat Kyuregyan - 10, Savalan Mirzoev - 22, Irma Zavadashvili - 11.

⁴²⁴ The rapporteurs from the Opposition are, as follows: Tanel Nakaidze - 12 Issues, Khatia Dekanoidze - 5.

⁴²⁵ The committee members are the rapporteurs for the 15 issues outlined in the Action Plan.

⁴²⁶ The Action Plan of the Education and Science Committee outlines 4 Strategic Goals, 13 Objectives and 80 Activities. The Action Plan is available at:

<https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/ganatileba/samoqmedo-gegma/samoqmedo-gegma-2024.pdf>, updated: 27.07.2024.

⁴²⁷ The Chairperson of the Committee, Givi Milkanadze, is a rapporteur for 30 Issues, his First Deputy Giorgi Chakvetadze - 13. From the remaining members, the rapporteurs are, as follows: Mariam Lashkhi - 12 Issues, Vladimir Kakhadze - 6 Issues, Baia Kvitsiani - 17 Issues, Genrieta Tsitsava - 1 Issue, Ramina Beradze - 9 Issues.

⁴²⁸ The rapporteur from the Opposition is Rostom Chkheidze - 1 Issue.

⁴²⁹ According to the action plan, "all members" are the rapporteurs on 10 issues.

⁴³⁰ The Action Plan of the Environmental Protection and Natural Resources Committee outlines 4 Main Directions, 13 Strategic Goals and 66 Activities. The Action Plan is available at:

<https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/garemo/samoqmedo-gegma/garemo-samoqmedo-gegma-2024.pdf>, updated: 27.07.2024.

⁴³¹ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Maia Bitadze (Chairperson) - 66 Issues, Khatia Tsilosani (First Deputy) - 66 Issues, Salome Kurasbediani - 65 Issues, Aleksandre Dalakishvili - 3 Issues, Giorgi Khakhubia - 12 Issues, Giorgi Tsagareishvili - 2 Issues, Goderdzi Chankasiani - 3 Issues.

Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee ⁴³²	✓ ⁴³³	-	-	-	-	-	-	✓ ⁴³⁴
Committee on European Integration ⁴³⁵	✓ ⁴³⁶	✓ ⁴³⁷	✓ ⁴³⁸	-	-	-	-	-
Defence and Security Committee ⁴³⁹	✓ ⁴⁴⁰	✓ ⁴⁴¹	✓ ⁴⁴²	-	-	-	-	-
Legal Issues Committee ⁴⁴³	✓ ⁴⁴⁴	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Culture Committee ⁴⁴⁵	✓ ⁴⁴⁶	✓ ⁴⁴⁷	-	-	-	-	-	✓ ⁴⁴⁸

⁴³² The Action Plan of the Sector Economy and Economic Policy Committee outlines 3 Strategic Goals, 11 Goals and 107 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/dargobrivi/kom-samoq-gegmi/2024.pdf>, updated: 27.07.2024.

⁴³³ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Davit Songhulashvili (Chairperson) – 80 Issues, Eka Sepashvili (First Deputy) – 19 Issues, Isko Daseni – 5 Issues, Gocha Enukidze – 5 Issues, Elguja Gotsiridze – 2 Issues, Levan Mgaloblishvili – 5 Issues, Vasil Chigogidze – 3 Issues, Bezhan Tsakadze – 6 Issues, Gela Samkharauli – 3 Issues, Irakli Kirtskhalia – 5 Issues.

⁴³⁴ From the Staff of the Committee, the Head of the Staff, Tamila Shabashvili, is a rapporteur for 6 Issues.

⁴³⁵ The Action Plan of the Committee on European Integration outlines 4 Strategic Goals, 9 Objectives and 53 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/evrointegracia/samoq-gegma/2024.pdf>, updated: 27.07.2024.

⁴³⁶ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Maka Bochorishvili (Chairperson) – 34 Issues, Levan Karumidze (First Deputy) – 2 Issues, Khatia Tsilosani – 2 Issues (Khatia Tsilosani is no longer a member of the Committee), Davit Songhulashvili – 10 Issues, Archil Talakvadze – 1 Issue, Viktor Sanikidze – 1 Issue, Nikoloz Samkharadze – 1 Issue, Nino Tsilosani – 1 Issue.

⁴³⁷ The Rapporteur from the Opposition on 1 Issue is Teona Akubardia.

⁴³⁸ One rapporteur referred to as “Other Members” is rapporteur for 1 Issue.

⁴³⁹ The Action Plan of the Defence and Security Committee outlines 5 Directions and 40 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/tavdacva/samoq-gegma/2024.pdf>, updated: 27.07.2024.

⁴⁴⁰ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Irakli Beraia (Chairperson) – 27 Issues. Irakli Beraia left the Parliament on 16 April 2024. Aleksandre Tabatadze (First Deputy) – 9 Issues, Tengiz Sharmanashvili – 2 Issues, Khatia Tsilosani – 2 Issues.

⁴⁴¹ The Rapporteur from the Opposition on 1 Issue is Teona Akubardia.

⁴⁴² Term “Committee Members” is used for 35 Issues.

⁴⁴³ The Action Plan of the Legal Issues Committee outlines 5 Strategic Goals, 7 Objectives and 28 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/iuriduli/samoq-gegmi/2024.pdf>, updated: 27.07.2024.

⁴⁴⁴ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Anri Okhanashvili (Chairperson) – 25 Issues, Davit Matkashvili (First Deputy) – 6 Issues, Rati Ionatamishvili – 1 Issue, Aluda Ghudushauri – 2 Issues, Aleksandre Tabatadze – 1 Issue, Mikheil Sarjveladze – 2 Issue (Mikheil Sarjveladze left the Parliament on 19 March 2024), Guram Macharashvili – 3 Issues, Irakli Shatakishvili – 2 Issues, Tengiz Sharmanashvili – 1 Issue.

⁴⁴⁵ The Action Plan of the Culture Committee outlines 4 Strategic Goals, 15 Objectives and 71 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/kultura/samoq-gegma/2024.pdf>, updated: 27.07.2024.

⁴⁴⁶ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Eliso Bolkvadze (Chairperson) – 59 Issues, Irakli Mezurnishvili (First Deputy) – 10 Issues, Givi Chichinadze – 7 Issues, Beka Odisharia – 5 Issues, Baia Kvtitsiani – 29 Issues, Isko Daseni – 2 Issues.

⁴⁴⁷ The Rapporteur from the Opposition on 1 Issue is Grigol Vashadze.

⁴⁴⁸ For each issue, a responsible person has been designated from the Staff of the Committee.

Regional Policy and Self-Government Committee ⁴⁴⁹	✓ ⁴⁵⁰		✓ ⁴⁵¹	-	-	-	-	✓ ⁴⁵²
Procedural Issues and Rules Committee ⁴⁵³	✓ ⁴⁵⁴	✓ ⁴⁵⁵	-	-	-	-	-	-
Budget and Finance Committee ⁴⁵⁶	✓ ⁴⁵⁷	✓ ⁴⁵⁸	-	-	-	-	-	-
Sport and Youth Affairs Committee ⁴⁵⁹	✓ ⁴⁶⁰	✓ ⁴⁶¹	-	-	-	-	-	-
Healthcare and Social Issues Committee ⁴⁶²	✓ ⁴⁶³	✓ ⁴⁶⁴	-	-	-	-	-	-

⁴⁴⁹ The Action Plan of the Regional Policy and Self-Government Committee outlines 4 Strategic Goals and 29 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/regionuli/samoqm-gegma-k/regionuli-samoqmedo-gegma-2024.pdf>, updated: 27.07.2024.

⁴⁵⁰ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Kakha Kakhishvili (Chairperson) - 7 Issues, Merab Kvarala - 2 Issues.

⁴⁵¹ Term "Committee" is used for 21 Issues.

⁴⁵² For each issue, a responsible person has been designated from the Staff of the Committee.

⁴⁵³ The Action Plan of the Procedural Issues and Rules Committee outlines 3 Directions and 38 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/saproceduro/samoqm-gegma/samoqmedo-gegma-2023.pdf>, updated: 09.01.2024.

⁴⁵⁴ The Thematic Rapporteurs from Majority are, as follows: Irakli Kadagishvili (Chairperson) – 38 Issues, Irakli Shatakishvili (First Deputy) – 23 Issues, Giorgi Kakhiani - 19 Issues, Salome Jinjolava - 3 Issues, Salome Jinjolava left the Committee on 29 April 2024, available at: <https://www.parliament.ge/parliament-members/5867/activity>, updated: 24.07.24, Levan Mgaloblishvili - 15 Issues, Genrieta Tsitsava - 19 Issues, Guram Macharashvili - 15 Issues.

⁴⁵⁵ The Rapporteurs from the Opposition are, as follows: Paata Manjgaladze - 3 Issues, Tamar Kordzaia - 3 Issues, Levan Bezhashvili - 2 Issues.

⁴⁵⁶ The Action Plan of the Budget and Finance Committee outlines 13 Directions. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/sapinanso/samoqm-gegma/safinanso-tematuri-2024.pdf>, updated: 24.07.2024.

⁴⁵⁷ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Paata Kvizhinadze (Chairperson) – 4 Directions, Gogi Meshveliani (First Deputy) – 5 Directions, Dilar Khabuliani - 1 Direction, Irakli Zarkua - 3 Direction, Bezhan Tsakadze - 3 Direction, Anton Obolashvili - 2 Direction, Zaal Mikeladze - 1 Direction, Irakli Kirtskhalia - 4 Issues.

⁴⁵⁸ The Rapporteurs from the Opposition are, as follows: Roman Gotsiridze – 1 Direction, Aleksandre Rakviashvili – 3 Directions, Beka Liliashvili - 5 Directions.

⁴⁵⁹ The Action Plan of the Sport and Youth Affairs Committee outlines 4 Directions, 10 Objectives and 29 Activities, available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/sporti/sam-gegma/sporti-samoqmedo-gegma-2024.pdf>, updated: 24.07.2024.

⁴⁶⁰ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Irakli Medzmariashvili (Chairperson) – 29 Issues, Viktor Sanikidze (First Deputy) – 23 Issues, Davit Katcharava – 21 Issues, Zaza Lominadze – 10 Issues, Irakli (Dachi) Beraia - 9 Issues, Imeda Nikuradze - 5 Issues, Shota Khabareli - 6 Issues, Levan Koblashvili - 2 Issues, Mikhheil Kavelashvili - 10 Issues.

⁴⁶¹ The Rapporteurs from the Opposition are, as follows: Rostom Chkhalidze - 3 Issues, Iago Khvichia - 2 Issues, Manuchar Kvirikvelia - 14 Issues.

⁴⁶² The Action Plan of the Healthcare and Social Issues Committee outlines 4 Strategic Goals and 48 Activities. The Action Plan is available at: <https://web-api.parliament.ge/storage/files/shares/Komitetebi/jandacva/sam-gegma/jandacva-samoqmedo-gegma24.pdf>, updated: 24.07.2024.

⁴⁶³ The Thematic Rapporteurs are, as follows: Zaza Lominadze (Chairperson) – 44 Issues, Vladimir Kakhadze (First Deputy) – 14 Issues, Ramina Beradze - 6 Issues, Zaal Mikeladze – 10 Issues, Irma Zavradasvili – 8 Issues, Dimitri Khundadze - 3 Issues, Anton Obolashvili - 3 Issues, Salome Jinjolava - 5 Issues.

⁴⁶⁴ The Rapporteurs from the Opposition are, as follows: Giorgi Godabrelidze – 4 Issues, Vakhtang Megrelishvili – 1 Issue, Ana Tsitladze – 2 Issue.